



United Nations
Educational, Scientific and
Cultural Organization



Global
Education
Monitoring
Report

ED/GEMR/MRT/2020/P1/22

Background paper prepared for the 2020 Global Education Monitoring Report

Inclusion and education

Textbooks and Inclusive Education

This paper was commissioned by the Global Education Monitoring Report as background information to assist in drafting the 2020 GEM Report, Inclusion and education. It has not been edited by the team. The views and opinions expressed in this paper are those of the author(s) and should not be attributed to the Global Education Monitoring Report or to UNESCO. The papers can be cited with the following reference: "Paper commissioned for the 2020 Global Education Monitoring Report, Inclusion and education". For further information, please contact gemreport@unesco.org.

1. Abstract
2. Introduction
3. Analysis Framework
4. Analysis
 - 4.1. Human Rights and Citizenship
 - 4.2. Minorities
 - 4.3. Gender
 - 4.4. Disabilities
 - 4.5. Socially Underprivileged Groups
5. Factors and Indicators of Inclusiveness
6. Conclusion
7. Bibliography
8. Background Data
9. List of Case Studies

1. ABSTRACT

Inclusive education has, in the light of diversified classrooms, become a global semantics. This topic is addressed by numerous studies and trend-setting writings by international stakeholders, resulting in frameworks such as the UDL (Universal Design for Learning). Differentiation aims to enable teachers to respond to diverse learners' needs (UNESCO, 2019c). The resulting principles, which seek to overcome barriers to inclusive learning processes, apply particularly to curricula and textbooks.

This report, based on an analysis of a sample of textbooks from 28 countries, shows that the subject of inclusion has become increasingly significant in terms of both structure and subject matter, and particularly in the contexts of human rights and citizenship. Social diversity is also increasingly taken into account and reflected upon, albeit with varying emphasis on the differing dimensions of diversity, given that genuinely intersectional perspectives via which these are linked only occur in isolated and rudimentary cases. With regard to inclusiveness in the gender-related dimension, the overall picture of the textbook sample under analysis here is a heterogeneous one; further, the incorporation of LGBTQIA+ perspectives remains insufficient. Nevertheless, the textbooks examined here do show increasing critical reflection on the social discrimination of different groups, and, ultimately, we do observe a significant trend towards a more pronounced consideration and representation of different social groups and minorities.

2. INTRODUCTION

With regard to the general aim of inclusion and inclusive education, school curricula and textbooks are crucial in several relevant aspects. Firstly, the modes of representation within textbooks and curricula should appropriately reflect the diversity of different groups of individual students. To this end, textbooks and curricula should, overall, employ inclusive language. Second, curricula and textbooks should include the representation of diverse identities and be free of divisive stereotypes and prejudices. Third, curricula and textbooks of civics/social studies, history, geography, and religion/ethics in particular should encompass the essential dimension of human rights and citizenship. This also implies the representation of inclusion and exclusion in different societal and historical contexts, in order to foster an awareness of and sensibility for the factual contingency and corresponding importance, as well as the consistent challenge of inclusion in society in general and in education in particular. These crucial aspects of inclusive education, detailed in the UNESCO report “Making Textbook Content inclusive: A focus on religion, gender, and culture” (UNESCO, 2017a), serve as the guiding principles for the following report on curricula and school textbooks for civics/social studies. This report, based on a global mapping of textbooks from more than 28 countries from all world regions, will thus analyse the inclusiveness of textbooks, identify crucial factors and indicators of inclusiveness, and critically highlight inclusionary as well as exclusionary practices.

Analysis framework on textbook inclusiveness

The overall analytical framework of the report will focus on three dimensions of the inclusiveness of school textbooks for civics/social studies. Firstly, it inquires as to the extent to which textbooks are written in inclusive language, especially with regard to gender, minorities and disabilities. This is important in order to optimise learning objectives with a view to imparting knowledge and information (the number of believers in a particular religion, for example, or exploring the actual role of women and explaining their marginalisation), as well as facilitating dialogue and critical reflection. Textbooks also teach students how to approach and interpret this knowledge. Critical attention to the language used in textbooks can serve to ensure that all students feel included in individual and collective enquiry. Some languages bear traces of inequality, such as those with grammatical rules indicating that masculine “takes precedence” over the feminine. And yet even those languages that have previously been discriminatory evolve and can express changes in gender relations, reflect diversity, and strive for equality.

Second, the report will investigate how and to what extent the crucial aspects and topics of human rights and citizenship are represented and reflected in textbooks in a manner that is, overall, inclusionary. Human rights are moral and legal norms, often enshrined in international treaties that uphold the equality and value of all individuals, regardless of differences in culture, gender, or religion. While textbooks play a vital role in conveying this message to students, the actual international instruments ratified by governments to guarantee freedom, equality, and non-discrimination must also be considered. Examining these documents broadens students’ perspectives and encourages them to think critically as they learn to contribute constructively to society. Furthermore, knowing that such instruments exist and have been upheld by

countries across the world reinforces the message that all individuals are equal and deserve respect. Yet, in order to enable an awareness of and sensitivity for factual contingency and its corresponding importance, as well as insisting on the challenge of inclusion in society in general and in education in particular, it is also important to include the factual representation of inclusion and exclusion in different societal, cultural, and historical contexts.

Third, the report will focus on the reflection and representation of different and diverse identities as well as different social groups, especially those who are socially underprivileged, in textbooks. It will examine whether the textbooks include an appropriate representation of gender, sexual identities, different minorities and disabilities, and different social classes, including underprivileged groups. Within this analysis it will also identify and problematise divisive stereotypes and prejudice with regard to different identities, in particular gender, minorities, and disabilities. Identity signifies both the recognition of a person's individuality as portrayed to or perceived by others, and as an individual's membership of a group, society, or community created by language, kinship, lifestyles, beliefs, or other common ties. According to Amartya Sen: "The very odd presumption that people of the world can be uniquely categorized by single and overarching systems of partitioning does not work anymore [...] we see ourselves as members of a variety of groups – we belong to all of them. Identity is multiple and shifting. No individual or country has a single unchanging identity." (UNESCO 2017a: 14, Sen 1999) This is increasingly the case as individuals become ever more mobile and migration becomes progressively more common. As a consequence of this and other aspects of globalisation, individuals – notably young people – are experiencing a greater diversity of identities than ever before. In our increasingly diverse societies it has become vital to ensure that individuals and groups with varied and ever-changing cultural identities interact and coexist harmoniously. Education that promotes empathy and a fuller mutual understanding of one another is conducive to the integration and participation of *all* citizens, ensuring the vitality of civil society. Great efforts should be made to ensure that textbooks and other learning materials provide a fair and accurate representation of the cultures that make up societies. This implies developing an educational approach that takes into account the diversity and the multiplicity of identities present within and across societies, an approach that respects specific features of societies while highlighting the exchanges and reciprocal relationships that create and sustain them.

3. A GLOBAL MAPPING OF THE INCLUSIVENESS OF TEXTBOOKS

The guiding five categories for the analysis are: human rights and citizenship, minority groups, gender and diverse sexual identities, disabilities, and socially underprivileged groups.

(1) The category of human rights is essential with regard to whether – and if so, which – different groups are explicitly or implicitly considered subjects and bearers of basic and fundamental rights. With regard to the category of citizenship it is also interesting to examine the extent to which these different groups are represented as and considered "normal" constituencies and active participants within the framework of the nation state. Similarly, the category of discrimination considers whether and to what extent real discrimination and prejudice against different groups in society and everyday life are sufficiently reflected in

the textbooks to raise awareness of such phenomena as ongoing and insistent challenges to the imperatives of human rights and citizenship.

(2) The category of minorities reflects whether and how these are considered and represented in the textbooks, fostering a sophisticated perspective on various phenomena and forms of inclusion and exclusion.

(3) The category of gender refers to the key aspect of an equal and appropriate representation of men and women, focusing on the representation and evaluation of women and their active roles and participation in society. This category also raises the question as to whether and how different sexual identities are considered and represented, reflecting the general inclusiveness and openness of textbooks with regard to different socio-cultural identities and corresponding lifestyles, while bearing in mind that the evaluation of this category may be subject to a Western bias.

(4) The category of disabilities serves to investigate whether, how and to what extent persons with disabilities are represented and given consideration.

(5) The category of socially underprivileged groups inquires as to whether and how social inequalities are (critically) reflected in the textbooks.

Catalogue of questions

Based on these principles the analysis focused on specific questions:

Human Rights/Citizenship

1. Are human rights and citizenship represented inclusively, i.e. with the inclusion of different genders, sexual identities, different kinds of minorities, people with disabilities, and different social classes, including underprivileged groups?
2. Is there a critical reflection of discrimination within society against these different groups?
3. Is there, in general, an appropriate representation of societal diversity within the context of human rights and citizenship?

Minorities

4. Are different minorities represented?
5. Which kinds of minorities are represented? E.g. ethnic and racialised, religious, or other minorities?
6. Are they represented in a stereotypical way?

Gender

7. Are the texts appropriately gendered?
8. Is there a balanced representation of gender – boys and girls, men and women – in pictures and illustrations?
9. Are there any elements of gender bias in the text that favour one sex over the other?
10. Are there stereotypical representations of gender or different sexual identities?

Disabilities

11. Are there people with disabilities present in the texts and visual material?
12. Are they presented in a stereotypical way (as dependent, less happy, passive, helpless)?
13. Do people with disabilities appear in everyday life or mainly in the context of care?
14. Are different types of disability represented?

Socially Underprivileged Groups

15. Are different social classes represented, including underprivileged groups?
16. Are they represented in a stereotypical way?

Inclusionary or Exclusionary Practices

17. Are there inclusionary practices which can be recommended as good practice? If yes, which are they?
18. Are there exclusionary practices? If yes, which are they?

4. ANALYSIS

4.1. Human Rights and Citizenship

The 2016 study, *International Civic and Citizenship Education* (Losito et al., 2017), unveiled a connection between the acquisition of knowledge about other countries' histories – and positive attitudes towards the rights of different ethnic groups (UNESCO, 2018a, p. 94). Human rights education has since become standard in curricula and textbooks (Bromley and Lerch, 2018, p. 347f.). This can also be seen in the sample examined here. The vast majority of the textbooks analysed cover the topic of human rights – sometimes in relation to the historical background, the global context and the situation in other countries; sometimes including the current situation within one's own country. This raises questions about the inclusion or exclusion of hitherto disadvantaged, completely excluded, or largely ignored population groups.

The main focus is usually on the implementation of human rights in national legislation through anti-discrimination and equality laws, as illustrated by the use of the *Ontario Human Rights Code* in the Canadian textbook example, as well as violations within one's own society. The Indonesian textbook, for instance, provides detailed information on human rights violations in the course of abuses of power and violent riots in recent national history, at the same time proffering a significant interpretation of human rights as a gift from a divine monotheistic god-figure. Within the framework of the national ideology of *Pancasila* ("five principles"), humanitarian and democratic principles are summarised with an emphasis on social justice and national unity. Similarly, the Bahraini textbook attempts to foster a process of identification via an intense examination of humanitarian laws and of how they compare with the fundamental principles of Muslim law.

The individual textbooks display diverse interpretations of citizenship – from national unity to global citizenship. The examples from China and Indonesia cultivate a multinational self-image and place particular emphasis on national cohesion via the unification of diverse ethnic groups and the fulfilment of duty by individual citizens. How are national identity and diversity expressed and how do these relate to rights and

responsibilities at the transnational level? Clear answers to this question are provided by the countries of Palestine, New Zealand and Canada, all of whom deal with the consolidation of the global community under the heading of **Global Citizenship** and here too promote inclusiveness, demonstrated by examples such as the signing of international treaties and conventions, but also by worldwide “grassroots movements” and digital inclusion. Such textbook examples reinforce the need to think on a more global scale regarding regional conditions and potentials and the imperative to conceive of citizenship as the membership of a global community (cf. Laura C. Engel, 2016).

In the context of citizenship, diversity is often treated as a central category. Diversity within a society is given varying weight by different textbooks: While the New Zealand textbook, for example, discusses diversity exclusively as ethno-cultural diversity and almost completely ignores gender diversity, the primary focus in the Swedish example is on the binary gender balance of men and women, with only vestigial reference to ethnic and religious diversity. On the whole, we can conclude that diversity is understood in many textbooks as an intersectional interplay of different factors, such as ethnicity, origin, language, religion, gender, sexual preference, education level, interests, etc. Cultural or culturalised diversity gains a particular visibility as a result of the presence of different religions and religious affiliations within a society. Cultural diversity is thus often associated with the question of religious symbols. Textbooks address, for example, the so-called headscarf dispute in Germany, and, in Canada, the legal regulations on wearing religious symbols of any kind – hijab, cruxifix, turban, etc. – with particular reference, however, to face coverings that create difficulties in identifying an individual. The case of Pardeep Singh Nagra is depicted, who successfully appealed to be allowed to wear a beard – an essential element of the Sikh faith – in the sport of boxing. Textbooks of both countries also refer to the burqa ban in France.

4.2. Minorities

Inclusion and consideration of migrants, refugees and displaced persons, both in curricula and in the classroom, is a special challenge for school education. As the 2019 GEM Report shows, more and more curricula and textbooks are incorporating multiculturalism. Whereas in 1980 this only affected Australia and Canada, in 2010 the topic was on the agenda in two thirds of countries, and four countries – Finland, Ireland, New Zealand and Sweden – have fully integrated multiculturalism (UNESCO, 2018a, p. 84). Indigenous peoples are increasingly addressed through national education programmes, for example in countries with a high proportion of indigenous people such as Australia, Brazil, Canada or Norway, or the integration of Roma people in some European countries. This applies in particular to the question of languages and multicultural teaching (UNESCO, 2017b, p. 26 ff.). In textbooks, however, as a new study on portrayals of Roma people shows, minorities remain very much under-represented. Indeed, the perspectives of minorities or their cultural, historical or economic background are largely ignored. Many textbooks that present diversity and multiculturalism in a positive light nevertheless remain attached to the “mainstream” and avoid critical discussion of complex and controversial topics (Niehaus, 2018, p. 332). Diversity, when mentioned, is still presented as a special topic and not as a normal feature of social coexistence. As previous textbook analyses have shown, a juxtapositioning of “us” and “them” still ultimately dominates, fostering a marginalisation of

“other” ethnic or religious groups and perpetuating stereotypes of certain minorities or of minorities in general.

The individual textbooks display differences in their use of the term “minority” (or its equivalent in the respective language), which may have an effect on, in particular, the representation of minorities and of the relationship between the (alleged) majority and certain minorities. While in the Chinese textbook example the power gap between the large Han group and the 55 national minorities is implicitly taken into account if not stated outright, and the legally anchored protection of minorities through state funding is underscored, the Indonesian textbook does not at any instance refer to Indonesia’s many ethnic and tribal groups as “minorities”. On the contrary, the concept of minorities would contradict the message of “Bhinneka Tunggal Ika” (“unity in diversity”; literally, “out of many, one”). While the Japanese textbook presents the indigenous Ainu as a recognised minority, its silence regarding the Ryukyu ethnic groups could, however, be interpreted in the context of the partly negative connotation of “minority” within Japanese society and also the rejection of the term by the Ryukyu; the latter are not *visible* and included as a “minority” in the selected textbook example. The Croatian textbook example deals explicitly with the distinction between “minority” in the numerical sense, and political inferiority in the context of power asymmetries. In the Nigerian textbook, on the other hand, where the identity of Nigeria as a “multi-ethnic country” is emphasised, use of the term is indiscriminate. The concept of a government majority – in terms of numerical superiority – is directly linked not only to a more effective representation of tribal interests, but also to its duty of care towards minority groups. The majority of textbooks reflect on precisely these power relations and the inclusion of disadvantaged groups at the level of political representation, legal amendments, state funding, and *de facto* discrimination.

There are significant differences from country to country regarding how ethno-cultural and religious diversity are addressed, depending on the specific make-up of the country in question. In the following we will differentiate between (1) countries with indigenous populations, (2) states with a history of segregation, (3) multi-ethnic states, (4) states that define themselves in terms of a specific region and (5) states that have only recently defined themselves as immigration countries. This is how the inclusion of indigenous peoples is dealt with in Australia, New Zealand and Canada, while multi-ethnic states such as Nigeria and Indonesia focus on the balance of power between the various ethnic groups. In the United States and South Africa, countries with a history of segregation, the relationship between the white and black populations is merely implicit, while the German textbook example undertakes an intensive study of migration, refugees and integration in more recent times. Examples from the MENA region are particularly significant in terms of how they portray religious political conflicts.

(1) The Australian textbook example develops its national self-image as a pluralistic society, with special attention to the indigenous Australians (Aboriginal and Torres Strait Islander people), whose status and rights are cited on numerous occasions as examples via which to explain the Australian constitution, legislative procedure and jurisdiction. Similarly, the New Zealand textbook, which introduces the term “superdiversity” and depicts migration as a constant and thus timeless phenomenon in the light of the continuous immigration of diverse ethnic groups – from the first settlement by Polynesian tribes to the recent migrants from East and

Southeast Asia as well as from other countries. In this context, historical cases of ethnic and religious discrimination are also addressed, such as against Germans resident in New Zealand during the two World Wars, or the “dawn raids” against Polynesian immigrants in the 1970s and 1980s. From the more recent past, the textbooks mention the vandalism of Jewish graves in Wellington in 2004, which led to the establishment of the *Diversity Action Programme: Te Ngira*. The textbook also includes some exercises in dealing with racism, stereotypes and cultural labels that encourage reflection and empowerment among students. The focus of the textbook is undoubtedly on the culture of the Māori, whose history, customs and skills are mentioned in almost every chapter, as well as their influence on today’s Aotearoa/New Zealand. The use of Māori terms to describe specific cultural concepts (*tauiwi*, *whakapapa*, *tūrangawaewae*) is particularly noteworthy. This kind of inclusion in textbooks goes beyond the examination of isolated content elements and applies the double aspect of inclusion, both by pointing to indigenous practices in society and also via the structural use of these within the textbook itself (cf. Olsen, 2017 on absence, inclusion, indigenization).

The example from Canada also points to the assimilation of indigenous elements into modern culture, such as via the practice of so-called “sentencing circles” in the Canadian judicial system. With regard to the Aboriginal people of Canada (First Nations, Métis, Inuit), the textbook selects topics from a broad temporal spectrum on the one hand (“residential schools” of the 19th/20th century, Meech Lake Accord of 1987), detailing their impact on the current situation, while, on the other hand, the textbook examines current controversial issues (such as the expansion of oil pipelines through land owned by Aboriginal peoples), movements (such as the Idle No More Movement), and influential persons (such as Shannen Koostachin or Elijah Harper). In doing so, the textbook forges a connection to the global status of indigenous peoples, by referring, for instance, to the United Nations Declaration on the Rights of Indigenous Peoples and to the “global indigenous movement”.

Textbook examples from Peru, Argentina and Mexico also show an inclusive approach to indigenous cultures. In Europe it is primarily Norway and Sweden that take the *Sámi* minority into account. A comparable example from the Japanese sample is that of the *Ainu* people.

At this point this report must mention the silence of the USA textbook on the history and situation of Native Americans. Despite ample opportunities in the relevant chapters to address the legal foundations, forms of self-government, or past and present cases of discrimination against native Americans, these opportunities are not acted upon.

(2) A similar depiction occurs in the context of countries with a history of segregation. Hispanic Americans and particularly African Americans are well represented in the USA textbook. African Americans are given a particularly prominent depiction in the context of desegregation and the civil rights movement in the USA (Montgomery Bus Boycott, Civil Rights Act 1964). The textbook also features a balanced selection of examples: special contributions, info boxes and exercises cover a variety of ethnic groups, genders, and age-groups. When addressing segregation in the past, it is notable that the South African textbook example mentions the subject of apartheid only once, somewhat casually, and only in connection with national commemorations and holidays. Discrimination in the post-apartheid era is recorded to the extent that the

xenophobically motivated attacks of 2008 against other African nationalities living in South Africa are labelled and treated as such. This is where critical civic education could make an important contribution (Spreen and Monaghan, 2016). The inclusion of white and black people, but also other people of colour, appears on a visual level via a balanced mixture of gender, age, race, skin colour, clothing, etc. In photographs and drawings, men and women, boys and girls with different skin and hair colours are depicted in diverse activities, roles and occupations. In the text we find a similar portrayal via the use of (ethnically marked) names of both real and fictional characters (e.g. Alisha, Rendani, Silindile) in interviews, examples and exercises. Apart from these, most text passages ignore distinguishing features of the different groups and represent diversity as (unmarked) normality.

(3) Textbook examples from countries with a long history of ethnic, tribal and religious conflict, such as Indonesia, China, Croatia or Nigeria, generally tend to cultivate the self-image of a plurinational state. In doing so, the emphasis is placed on cultural commonalities and enrichment via diversity, on reflection processes regarding power relations and representation, state welfare, and the fulfilment of civic duty. The Indonesian example shows an exemplary and consistent textbook treatment of state identity-forming principles: under the heading of *Bhinneka Tunggal Ika* (“unity in diversity”; literally, “out of many, one”) and the national idea of *Pancasila* (“five principles”), Indonesia’s cultural diversity is conceived of as riches to be maintained and promoted. The textbook, with its respectful handling of religious, ethnic, sub-ethnic and linguistic diversity, promotes values such as openness, tolerance, inclusion and respect for human rights. The textbook also deals, however, with the history of Indonesia, with socio-cultural and inter-religious conflicts as well as cases of human rights violations. While the textbook emphasises domestic inclusiveness, it simultaneously warns against harmful external influences and a decline in values in the course of globalisation.

The Chinese example also venerates national unity and harmony among the Han and the national minorities. Inclusiveness is guaranteed by state control on the one hand; i.e. special allowances for members of (non-Han) minorities and forms of self-governance in the Autonomous Regions, and on the other, by citizens fulfilling their duty to preserve national interests. There is no mention, however, of the past and ongoing tensions between the central government and ethnic minorities (Uyghurs, Tibetans) as well as spiritual groups (Falun Gong), or of the related human rights issues.

(4) The examples in this report from the MENA region (Egypt, Bahrain, Israel, Palestine) deal primarily with religious issues in relation to human rights and citizenship, partly via a general conveyance of values such as religious tolerance in the context of human rights and peace education, and partly in relation to specific conflicts. The textbook example from Israel locates the question of citizenship within the controversial debate around the Right of Return, which isolates the identity-building characteristic of religion and ignores all other distinctions. This inevitably leads to the contradiction of the alleged equality of all Israeli citizens regardless of their religious convictions, gender, class, etc., as well as the discriminatory consequences for – especially – people of Arab origin or the Muslim faith. The latter is critically reflected on and analysed using both historical cases and current controversies. The Egyptian textbook also addresses the Israeli-Palestinian conflict in a chapter dedicated to the topic, elaborating on the historical events from an objective point of

view. Equally notable in this example is the absence of state-internal minorities in the textbook. Ethnic minorities are only discussed in relation to other nations (Brazil, Nigeria, India). The textbook from Bahrain covers the subject of citizenship extensively, with an emphasis on national unity and how individual citizens can contribute to it. The nature of Bahraini society is located in the “Arab and Islamic identity”, which conjures a somewhat essentialist image, while elsewhere in the textbook emphasis is placed on the multiethnicity of Bahrain as well as the importance of intercultural exchange. The Palestinian textbook textually and visually represents ethnic, religious and cultural diversity in a global dimension while it stresses that no nation in the world is formed exclusively by one ethnicity or culture.

(5) Migration and refugees are nothing new. Socio-economic and political circumstances, especially in recent times, have led to demographic shifts, an increase in cultural diversity, and a wealth of identity models in individual countries. The selected examples reflect this trend in most cases, by addressing immigration and integration in depth, personal life stories and plans, but also cases of conflict and discrimination. In the textbook example from Germany, immigrants and their descendants are subsumed under the umbrella term “people with a migration background”, with a comprehensive chapter dedicated to the subject. Here, the textbook discusses various groups (first-generation, second-generation, late repatriates, etc.), possible reasons for migration (search for employment, political persecution, etc.), various degrees of inclusion/exclusion of both individuals and entire cultural groups (“transnationalism”, “parallel society”), individual models of the self (“hybrid identity”), as well as prejudice and xenophobia (Pegida, AfD, etc.).

4.3. Gender

A number of studies explore issues relating to gender-responsive teaching and learning in the context of textbooks. It has been pointed out for many years now that women and girls are under-represented in educational materials and are afflicted by stereotypes. A UNESCO analysis of 110 national curriculum frameworks in 78 countries revealed, for instance, that gender biases still prevail (UNESCO, 2019a, p. 10 and UNESCO, 2017b, p. 24ff.). There is clearly still some way to go before fulfilling the objective of depicting the sexes free of stereotypes, representing them equally, portraying them in different professions and roles in the family and community, as well as addressing the needs and experiences of men and women in equal measure. Although gender equality programmes have been developed in numerous countries, textbook analyses have shown that, in Iran in 2006 and 2007 for example, only 37% of images in textbooks depicted women, and in many countries women are still portrayed in a stereotypical manner. Another study, however, clearly shows that there has been a significant improvement over the past few decades. While women’s rights were mentioned in only 15% of textbooks from 1946 to 1947, this figure increased to 37% for the years 2000-2013 (UNESCO, 2016a, p. 53 and IBE 2016). In countries such as Vietnam or Ghana efforts are being made to evaluate textbooks with regard to gender sensitivity (UNESCO, 2018b, p. 52f.; UNESCO, 2016b and UNESCO, 2019b, p. 40). In many countries in Africa, North and South America, Asia and Europe, sexual orientation and gender identity are addressed in curricula, but implemented in textbooks in different ways.

Generally speaking, sexual and gender identity remain very much inadequately addressed in schools (UNESCO, 2016c, p. 87f.; UNESCO 2015 and Blumberg 2015). This is particularly evident in relation to the treatment of different sexual identities (LGBTIQIA+), which are almost completely absent from textbooks, or subject to misrepresentation, marginalisation, or portrayed in a stigmatising manner (UNESCO, 2016c, p. 88 and UNESCO, 2018c, p. 10). Furthermore, these groups almost exclusively allude to white, able-bodied, middle-class homosexuals (Höhne and Heerdegen, 2018, p. 240). Australia and New Zealand constitute exceptions in this regard, however, as previous studies have shown.

In the vast majority of textbooks examined here, however, the representation and reflection of gender is understood exclusively in binary terms; that is, in relation to the positions and roles of men and women within a society. Individuals who do not correspond to heteronormativity are absent in most textbooks. Of these textbooks, a very large proportion of them do give a numerically balanced representation: illustrations, whether photographs or drawings, alternatively show girls and boys, men and women, cartoon characters with male or female features, or mixed groups. Textbook examples from the MENA region (Egypt, Bahrain, Israel, Palestine), Cameroon and Croatia show significantly more or exclusively male persons, in powerful positions of business or politics, while their depictions of women are usually located in the domestic sphere of family, parenting and everyday tasks.

In the cases of Canada and Sweden, on the other hand, the opposite is true and the female gender tends to be portrayed more frequently. This impression is further intensified by portrayals of women as successful, non-domestic role models: politicians, journalists, activists, sportswomen, etc. Some textbooks also include – more or less implicitly – an intersectional aspect: the South African textbook mentions the paralympic world champion Natalie du Toit several times; and the Australian textbook presents Cathy Freeman, an athlete of indigenous descent. The Canadian textbook presents an interview with the female politician Jean Augustine, one of the first black Canadians in the House of Commons, and frequently refers to First Nations women such as Shannen Koostachin and the founders of the Idle No More movement. Similarly, the Brazilian textbook, which generally points to the social inequality between Afro-Brazilians and Non-Afrodescendants, mentions the special situation of Brazilian women of African descent.

With regard to gender equality, the gender pay gap between men and women, discrimination of women in the workplace and in education, the under-representation of women in positions of power, female quotas, violence against women and sexism are frequently addressed issues, as well as, from a historical perspective, the development of women's suffrage. In some countries, teenage pregnancy, traditional expectations of women, and women in the military are also mentioned. Topics reflecting modern male roles are touched upon indirectly, if at all. The German textbook constitutes an exception in this regard elucidating within the topic area of the family different forms of modern life and the roles of men as homemakers and fathers. Single fathers are also mentioned in this context. This aspect, specifically the *Fathers4Justice* movement which advocates for the interests of fathers in custody cases, is also addressed by the British textbook.

To a large extent, the selected country examples use gender-neutral language or at least make a well-intentioned effort to do so. In some cases the masking of gender is language-specific, as in Japanese, Chinese,

Bahasa and Indonesia. Examples from the MENA region (Egypt, Bahrain, Israel), on the other hand, predominantly use phrasing that gives preference to the male perspective. For the inclusion of male, female and diverse genders, care must be taken to ensure a reflected choice of words, sentence construction and direct appeal to the readership. Depending on the language, strategies may consist in the use of plural forms for nouns and pronouns, e.g. “citizens”, with “they” and “them” in the following sentences. Likewise, the use of pair forms such as “Schülerinnen und Schüler”, “profesorul/profesoara”, “his or her” or “they” as a singular pronoun, as in “Does a person have to declare their gender?” (Australia) ensures that all genders are addressed in equal measure. With regard to job titles, “police officer”, “fire fighter” and “chairperson” correspond to the current standard for gender-sensitive language. Terms such as “manpower” (Nigeria), on the other hand, do not.

Only one in four textbooks includes topics relevant to people from the worldwide LGBTQIA+ community. While the inclusive approach to gender relations in the majority of textbooks refers to heteronormative men and women, a few other examples (primarily Canada, Australia, Germany), feature more comprehensive questions pertaining to gender and identity. This occurs mostly in relation to the legislation of the respective country, in particular the legalisation of same-sex marriage and anti-discrimination laws, as well as global activism. The Australian textbook also explores the case of Norrie May-Welby, a gender-neutral person who asserted their status as such before the Australian High Court in 2014. The Canadian example discusses the nationwide *gay-straight alliance clubs* (GSA), which since the *Accepting Schools Act* of 2012 can be set up in schools across the country and are intended to create a safe and inclusive environment in which students of all gender identities can meet. With this example, the textbook also presents a specific case of conflicting interests and fundamental rights, as what the GSA considers the fulfilment of freedom of speech and freedom of assembly represents a restriction of religious freedom for followers of the Catholic faith, who see their religious convictions violated by the open discussion about sexual orientation.

Beyond a purposeful discussion on gender-related rights, a more general inclusive reflection on life plans and the family can also prove productive. The German textbook example takes into account a colourful spectrum of possible ways of life in the area of the family: patchwork families, unmarried and childless women, single fathers, two-mother families, etc. The portrayal of role models for men, women and various genders are thus implicitly relaxed. The same chapter also offers a section explicitly on teaching role models in parenting, deconstructing them on the basis of alleged preferences, interests and competencies (girls being considered emotional and boys interested in technology). Alongside the topic areas of legislation and the family, sex education is also a suitable subject area for educating on gender identities. All the more striking is the inadequate treatment of the subject in the South African textbook, which – despite featuring an entire chapter on sexual behaviour and sexual health – only discusses health and prevention in the context of heteronormative sex, ignoring other sexual preferences and specific health risks.

4.4. Disabilities

Learners with disabilities face particular problems due to their reduced access to mainstream education. Providing adequate materials and technologies is a prerequisite for their integration. Although there are special integration programmes in many countries, people with special needs are very rarely addressed in teaching materials. One study has shown that people with disabilities are mentioned in only 9% of social science textbooks for secondary school, only a small increase since the 2% ascertained for 1970-1979 (UNESCO, 2018d, p. 11). In South Africa, only two out of 40 textbooks used in 2015 featured depictions of people with disabilities. In other countries, too, only approximately 1% of textbook images showed disabled people. Here too, there are exceptions, such as in the case of Mexican textbooks.

In this context, the analysis of the sample selected for this report reveals certain changes or developments. Some two-thirds of the textbook examples analysed here mention the situation of people with physical or mental disabilities. As a rule, this is done – as in the case of gender – by means of examples of legislative changes or amendments. In the context of general considerations on equality before the law and lived equity within a society, keywords such as “anti-discrimination law”, “accessibility” and “state welfare” are used. The concept of disability is thus in part extended to include chronically ill people (particularly those suffering from HIV/AIDS) and the elderly.

As in the case of gender, the role models portrayed are crucial for the general inclusion of disability-related contents and the frequency with which they occur, as is the degree to which portrayed disabled people are presented as autonomous individuals in terms of interest and commitment, and thus as obvious actors within other social groups (cf. Pogorzelska, 2016, p. 30 ff.).

Images in the textbooks usually show people with physical disabilities, illustrated by wheelchairs, crutches or other assistive devices. Only rarely are disabled people depicted in non-disability related contexts. An exception is the Romanian textbook, which in its section on non-violence in schools shows a sprinter with one arm and a man in a wheelchair playing a guitar. The Canadian example also shows people with disabilities as autonomous individuals, activists and public figures, such as sports personality Rick Hansen in a meet-and-greet with young people.

Moreover, the topic “accessibility for all” addresses not only people with physical disabilities by referring, for instance, to barrier-free building standards, but also people with aids for sensory impairments (sign language interpreters, documents in large print, Braille, audio or electronic formats).

There is also the question of diversity within a group: When people with disabilities are included in a group, how diversely is disability presented with regard to the type of disability and in correlation with other characteristics, such as ethnic/religious minority, gender or age-group? (Cf. Reichenberg, 2017 on a selection of Swedish textbooks.)

Finally, the South African textbook entitled *Life Orientation*, combining social studies topics and sports exercises in each individual chapter, deserves a special mention. There is an obvious positive trend here, as men and women with disabilities are considered several times and in relation to different types of disability, such as physical impairment, sensory impediment or a learning disorder. Further, a number of Paralympic

athletes are presented both in the text and in images, including swimming world champion Natalie du Toit, wheelchair tennis champion Lucas Sithole, and others. In the section on “volunteer activities”, disabled young people are depicted engaging in voluntary work to help children less fortunate than themselves. On the whole, people with disabilities are presented in positions of autonomy and active participation, independently pursuing their own interests and convictions.

4.5. Socially underprivileged groups

Alongside gender, ethnicity and physical/mental disability, other situations equally merit attention from textbooks. Social class, poverty, homelessness, illness, old age, or the simple fact of still being a child can all present serious obstacles to full participation in society. Recent studies show, however, that the representation of different social classes and socio-economic inequality seems to have declined in the last few years, not least due to a cultural turn in the humanities and social sciences with the rise of postmodernism and the general critique of Marxism (Chisholm, 2018, p. 233). Notwithstanding this trend, the problem of poverty, both from a global perspective and within one’s own nation-state, nevertheless appears in more than half of the textbook sample examined here. The books address the growing gap between rich and poor, (unfair) payment or taxation, and social security. The German example further provides information on possible causes, symptoms and consequences of poverty, on the discrimination specifically endured by foreigners in the context of poverty, and children from underprivileged households. An equally broad scope is offered by the Russian textbook, which includes in its portrayal homeless and neglected children, war veterans, refugees and the elderly. Illustrations of people begging, inadequately dressed, or rooting through rubbish bins only serve to reinforce stereotypes of poverty that are often connected with homelessness. Photographs and caricatures show people living on the streets, often with the associated objects of sleeping bag, cardboard sign or dog. In contrast, the Canadian textbook includes the topic of homelessness without showing a picture of a homeless person. Rather, a photograph of a group of young people in eye-catching shirts publicise the “5 Days for the Homeless” campaign.

We find a more sophisticated approach to the topic of poverty in the Palestinian textbook, which throughout its pages raises awareness for the situation of the less fortunate. The South African textbook equally demonstrates an inclusive portrayal of difficult living circumstances. Here, individual lifestyle choices are addressed at various points, taking both external and internal factors into account. Possible life crises due to illness or loss are also discussed, with constructive strategies as to how these might be resolved. A specific topic in the Nigerian example is the situation of people infected with HIV or suffering from AIDS, who not only try to live their lives with a lifelong illness but are often marginalised by social stigma. The textbook responds by unveiling myths surrounding how the disease is transmitted and by appealing to the readers’ compassion. The example from Japan refers to the Buraku social class, which has suffered a long history of discrimination within Japanese society. In the Brazilian example a special focus is on domestic migration groups and their situation as a result of rural-urban migration.

A further special case of social exclusion is the notion of “untouchability”, and this is critically addressed in the Indian textbook. The book also examines difficult living conditions and possibilities for support on the basis of specific characteristic that lead to social disadvantage. Those affected can be women, people with (physical or mental) disability, or members of certain tribes and castes. The textbook provides information on the classification system of Scheduled Castes, Scheduled Tribes and Other Backward Classes, which are associated with special regulations and quotas, but which – as the book expressly states – are not to be regarded as discriminatory.

In some cases, the social situation of children on a global scale and their particular need for protection is included in the subject matter. In the context of human rights, some textbooks also specifically address children’s rights, particularly in reference to the UN Convention on the Rights of the Child. The exploitation of children through child labour and as child soldiers is problematised from a global perspective. The textbook reminds the readers to not forget that there are also poor or neglected children in the rich countries of the First World, and clearly points to their need for special protection, regardless of other social characteristics: a child of illegalised immigrants also has an unconditional right to education.

5. FACTORS AND INDICATORS OF THE INCLUSIVENESS OF TEXTBOOKS

The global mapping of textbooks has identified and analysed the major factors and indicators of the inclusiveness of textbooks which can be categorised by the following criteria:

- Structure of the textbook with regard to inclusiveness: inclusion as important topic and chapter and/or inclusiveness as guiding principle of the textbook as a whole?
- elaboration of relevant concepts with regard to inclusion and exclusion
- Accessibility and comprehensibility of language and the different textual and visual formats and elements of the textbook
- References to real life-worlds of students
- Awareness and critical reflection of factual discriminations and exclusions in society
- Overall inclusive approaches to citizenship and human rights
- Societal and historical contextualisations which reflect the contingency of inclusion
- Awareness and recognition of societal diversity in terms of gender and sexual identities, minorities, disabilities as normal as well as appropriate representations of these identities, differences, and diversities

On the whole, the analysis of the 28-country textbook sample has shown that the factors and indicators mentioned are particularly crucial with regard to inclusiveness. In the following these key factors and indicators of inclusiveness will be identified and discussed using textbook examples. The key factors influencing the inclusiveness of textbooks can often be deduced from the textbook descriptions themselves, insofar as these can also be analysed as indicators of the respective social framework conditions.

1. First of all, the significance of inclusion as a factor and indicator for inclusiveness can be identified and explored by examining the overarching thematic coverage, the structural design, the logical shaping of the argument, and the synopsis of a textbook. Inclusion can thus be conveyed as a topic in itself as such, in a variety of other thematic contexts, or equally in the sense of a strategically overarching or consistent leitmotif throughout a textbook. Inclusion, exclusion, and relevant related terminology and concepts thus need to be defined in an accessible and comprehensible manner. In the textbook from Mexico, for instance, a conceptual definition of inclusion as one of ten basic principles and in second place after “congruencia” and alongside further principles such as peaceful conflict resolution and respect (p. 9) is laid out in the manner of a quasi-foreword presenting the book’s agenda with practical guidelines regarding its use. And in the textbook from Cameroon, various social conceptual phenomena – such as superiority complex, prejudice, sexism, caste systems, and marginalisation – are reflected upon and explained in terms of exclusion as an antithesis to inclusion (p. 47). Ultimately, however, it is important to reflect on the overall extent to which the widespread abstract and programmatic declaration of inclusion as an overarching norm often implicitly applies primarily and even exclusively to the respective in-group, effectively excluding – if not explicitly naming - out-groups. This becomes particularly clear in the Indonesian textbook that describes inclusion as a general norm and, at the same time, explicitly warns of negative external influences in relation to globalisation. After all, it is important to analyse the significance of inclusion within the framework of the respective structure, design and synopsis as well as the argumentative logic of a textbook, both quantitatively and qualitatively, in order to explore and evaluate the inclusiveness of textbooks. On the whole, the sample of textbooks analysed here has revealed that the aspect of inclusion has gained in significance, both in terms of structure and subject matter.

2. A second overarching and basic factor and indicator of inclusiveness is the accessibility and intelligibility of both the language used in the texts and the imagery depicted by the visual and graphic elements of the textbook, as well as their mutual interplay. Accessibility in this sense refers not only to the formal didactic aspects such as age-appropriate language, but beyond this, and more specifically, it means that the textbook elements of text and image bear in mind the real and usually diverse life-worlds of learners in modern-day society. In doing so, however, it is important to take into account different didactic cultures and, accordingly, different socio-culturally shaped receptions of (educational) media, as well as the respective linguistic and iconographic traditions in the various countries. The complexity of this aspect demands more detailed study, such as the case studies proposed in the conclusion to this report, in order to arrive at meaningful results that could support more general statements in this respect.

3. Third, gender-sensitive language and the quantitatively balanced and qualitatively equal presence and representation of the sexes in textbook are both a basic and key factor and indicator of inclusiveness. Nowadays in particular, the inclusion of gender means taking into account diverse gender identities and sexual orientations: men, women and LGBTQIA+ should be represented in equal measure in textbooks. The visibility of the various groups is a crucial factor, especially the frequency with which they are portrayed in both text and image, as well as the quality of the presentation. Are there stereotypical features and what role models are conveyed?

This brings us to the further question as to what extent other genders and sexual identities (LGTB) are addressed, considered and represented in addition to the two heteronormative genders of male and female. The use of language, which reflects the perspective of the author, reader and society with regard to who is talking to whom about whom, is already an essential aspect of inclusion, especially when it comes to textbook design. Particularly significant are the exercises and assignments in textbooks and the way in which learners are directly addressed. The language in the two textbooks from Bahrain and Egypt, for instance, almost exclusively addresses male students. From a comparative perspective, the very different structures of different languages must be taken into account, with regard to the use of (linguistic) genders in their different grammatical functions. Some languages, for example, do not differentiate between genders in their grammar at all. Nevertheless, the practice of appropriate gendering – or indeed, neglect of such – is a relevant factor and indicator as regards inclusiveness. A corresponding linguistic practice often goes hand in hand with stereotypical representations of gender roles or even the (near) omission of one gender. In a Croatian textbook, for example, the texts are not at all gendered, with the result that the female form as such does not occur; even the visual images portray – with only one exception – exclusively men and boys.

How, and in which societal roles the sexes primarily appear requires a closer look in this context in order to examine and evaluate inclusiveness with regard to gender. In the Japanese textbook, for instance, men and women are presented in equal measure from a quantitative point of view; however, the book features only one example in which men care of their children in their role as fathers, while women very often appear – throughout the book – in their role as mothers. The Palestinian textbook visualises women as passive entities, usually in precarious situations and contexts, such as as refugees, while men are generally portrayed in active positions of power such as soldiers, doctors, businessmen, etc. The Swedish and the South African textbook, on the other hand, depict women at least as frequently as men in prominent and leading powerful positions, as politicians, activists, or in professions traditionally regarded as “male”. The overall picture regarding gender in terms of inclusiveness in the sample analysed here produces highly heterogeneous results, with the consideration of LGBTQIA+ at a deficit throughout the sample.

4. On a more specific content level, the thematic and strategic portrayal of human rights and citizenship constitutes a key factor and indicator of inclusiveness. Above all, this is a criterion for the extent to which human rights in general and the specific rights associated with citizenship not only address an abstract – in whichever form – or even a more specific, relatively homogeneous, majority society, but also an inherently diverse and differentiated one. This is directly linked to the extent to which the conveyance of human rights and citizenship inherently and strategically operates in tandem with the portrayal of a diverse society. This can be implemented using a more complex text, visual images, or media within a textbook, and this can certainly be ambivalent and unclear. A crucial factor is, however, clearly the specific tradition and history of the country in question, as well as the depiction of such in the textbook.

In the Australian textbook, for example, social diversity in its various dimensions such as gender, race, social class, etc. is consistently given overarching and extensive consideration within the context of citizenship, while in other thematic contexts the reader finds only young white people. In the textbook from Cameroon, diversity is particularly emphasised in relation to human rights, while in the context of citizenship national

unity is explicitly and clearly given preference before diversity, doubtless a consequence of the colonial past with the French republican model (p. 68f.). In line with the latter, the French textbook particularly emphasises republican unity, albeit complemented by the now so-called fundamental value of diversity. In the context of this logic, diversity appears consistently in its various dimensions throughout the textbook in an unmarked form. Following a similar logic, diversity features in the Romanian and the Russian textbook in the context of a primarily abstract general definition of the universal nature of human rights and citizenship.

The textbook from Peru, on the other hand, reflects the history of the country's emergence as a multi-ethnic nation-state by explicitly including the specific ethnic minorities and indigenous groups within the framework of the human rights and citizenship under the heading "Somos una nación diversa" ("we are a diverse nation", p. 6ff.). The extent to which the specific history of each nation-state determines the presentation of human rights and citizenship is also demonstrated in the German textbook that describes German citizenship in the context of the various groups and historical circumstances of "people with a migration background".

The Swedish textbook, on the other hand, presents a quasi-overarching, detailed problematisation of citizenship with regard to real social power relations and discrimination in relation to various categories of social diversity, such as gender, nationality, ethnicity, class and religion. In the analysed textbooks from New Zealand, South Africa and Great Britain, diversity in its various dimensions is emphasised in its capacity to inspire identity in the context of citizenship. Similarly, the Indonesian textbook explicitly refers to the specific human right of education in order to underline the importance of diversity in its ethno-cultural, religious and social dimensions as a factor fostering identity.

On the whole, the analysis of the textbook sample shows that, while societal diversity is generally given increasing consideration and reflection, this occurs with a significant shifting of weight, from one very specific dimension of diversity to another; genuinely intersectional perspectives bringing together the various dimensions are only to be found in isolated – and inadequate – cases.

5. A fifth factor and indicator of inclusiveness is critical reflection on the actual discrimination of certain social groups on the basis of gender, sexual identity, ancestry, religion, disability, or social status, and in its various forms such as prejudice, stereotypes and violence. This is also connected with a critical portrayal of historical and socially-conditioned contingency and the resulting insistent challenge of upholding universal human rights, citizenship, and protection of the rights of various social groups and minorities – making mention, particularly, of resistance to inclusion ultimately motivated by discrimination, prejudice and negative stereotypes. Here too, the history and tradition of each nation-state constitute crucial factors when critically reflecting on discrimination against specific groups within society.

Accordingly, the textbook from Cameroon reflects critically on colonially inspired racism and discrimination against traditional population groups and women. The New Zealand textbook also presents historical and current experiences of discrimination based on race, gender and religion in the context of national history (p. 42ff.). In the Spanish textbook, various forms of discrimination and intolerance towards different groups such as (ethnic) minorities, persons with disabilities, and socially underprivileged groups are reflected upon systematically and in a relatively abstract manner – albeit in equal measure. The Norwegian textbook

emphasises that the Sámi ethnic minority enjoy certain rights without explicitly reflecting on the fact that this can also in fact constitute a form of exclusion. The Australian textbook critically reflects upon the emergence of prejudice within society as a result of mass media. The textbook from New Zealand asks the students to reflect critically on their own stereotypes and to actively confront cultural and racist labelling in everyday society (p. 47). The German, Argentinian, Australian and New Zealand textbooks address cultural, partially racist, stereotypes; either by critically examining racism and xenophobia as such (Argentina), by the use of caricatures and jokes (Germany), via exercises involving assertiveness in the face of othering (New Zealand: labelling, cultural stereotypes, racist remarks) or via critical reflection on the media regarding the image of a country in its film and television, music and popular culture (Australia and New Zealand).

Discrimination is addressed in historical descriptions or in the discussion of current conflicts. The Israeli textbook, on the one hand, provides historical information on the expropriation and dismissal of Arab workers, as well as on controversial issues such as unrecognised (Arab) settlements and the Right of Return, which is to a certain extent discussed as discriminatory towards non-Jews. The textbook from Cameroon, on the other hand, focuses on discrimination and prejudice against the tribes formerly known as “pygmies”. In addition to ethnic and religious distinctions, the Indian textbook also discusses a number of factors that can lead to socio-economic disadvantage. The country-specific classification system of Scheduled Castes, Scheduled Tribes and “Other Backward Classes”, for example, is addressed in this context.

On the whole, the textbooks examined for this report show an increasingly critical reflection on social discrimination (in its various forms from explicitly stated prejudice through structural disadvantage to open violence) against a variety of different groups.

6. Finally, an indicator and decisive factor in terms of inclusiveness is to communicate a pronounced awareness and recognition of the different and diverse social groups and thus of diversity as a social norm. The central criterion in this respect is the textual and visual representations of social diversity in its different dimensions, such as gender, sexual identity, ancestry, religion, disability or social status. This is also intrinsically linked to the extent to which members of these social groups are accepted and represented as individuals and as differentiated rather than being subject to generalisations or stereotypically regarded as homogenous. Prevailing national traditions and social discourses manifest themselves in the respective examinations of certain social groups in the individual countries, and their depiction and possible critical reflection in textbooks then marks a central factor and indicator of inclusiveness in textbooks. This is reflected in the use of certain terminology and markers. In the individual textbooks the word “minority”, or equivalent designation in the respective language, is employed in different ways, which can influence how inclusiveness is considered. The quality of pictorial representations of ethnic and religious groups is a consequence of the correlation between cultural markers and other social characteristics, as well as the subject context. In Australian textbooks the pronounced inclusion of indigenous content stands out, yet the depiction of indigenous individuals is limited to specific corresponding chapters while the sections on economics, on the other hand, exclusively depict young, white people. It also appears necessary to depict Aboriginal peoples as unambiguously ethnic, that is to say in traditional dress, face paint or with their national flag. This is

comparable with the Peruvian example where ethnic minorities are generally presented in traditional costume.

The visual representation of First Nations peoples in the Canadian textbook, however, is far more nuanced: they are depicted in different social contexts and roles, with modern clothes and hairstyles, sometimes clearly characterised and sometimes subtly, with information on ethnicity being added where appropriate as the final piece of information. US American examples display similar fluidity, which capture social diversity through a multifaceted interplay of (culturally marked) names, appearance, roles, interests etc. Rare and stereotypical depictions of Native Americans are therefore all the more obvious. The Peruvian textbook intensively and repeatedly focuses on the indigenous population as an ethnic minority, but the textual and visual depiction, predominantly of people in traditional costume for example, has the appearance of being excessively stereotypical. As a direct comparison, it is particularly indicative that the Romanian textbook scarcely even mentions the historically relevant Roma and Hungarian ethnic minorities. The textbook from the USA is striking in this context by its depiction, on the one hand, of different ethnic groups as socially anchored in diverse roles, while on the other hand the Native Americans rarely appear in the context of their current social situation, and where they do, they are stereotypically depicted in traditional costumes and with a conventional appearance (p. 8; 12). By contrast, the indigenous population of Australia is primarily depicted in the Australian textbook in connection with its largely precarious social situation. The textbook from Bahrain depicts socially underprivileged groups such as refugees, asylum seekers, the poor and children predominantly as subjects whose rights are protected by international organisations. The textbook from Great Britain, on the other hand, which generally comes across as being fundamentally sensitive of diversity as a social norm, also includes a statistic that establishes a link between criminality and the origin of certain social groups.

The inclusion of LGBTIQIA+ and people with disabilities, however, is on the whole strongly determined by current events, in particular specific court cases and verdicts and the reception given these in public debate and through the mass media within the relevant nation-state, which are more or less explicitly reflected upon and addressed by the textbooks. This is particularly the case for the institutionalisation and legalisation of same-sex marriage, for example, and the (past) societal discrimination of LGBTIQIA+, on which the relevant sections in the Australian and New Zealand textbooks focus. Further, the explicit representation of people with disabilities tends to occur in the context of the struggle for equality and the assertion of general and specific citizen's rights, as the textbooks from Romania, South Africa, the USA and India show. A tentatively globalised discourse on anti-discrimination and equality is manifest here as a crucial factor. Against this background, however, the textbook from Russia states, devoid of all criticism, that people with disabilities are not entitled to marry on the basis that they are unable to care for their families. This ultimately also demonstrates the extent to which the textbooks with a primarily national framework adopt – or ignore – global discourses that transcend the nation-state.

At the same time, however, a general trend towards a more pronounced consideration and representation of different social groups and minorities can also be observed here.

6. CONCLUSION

Inclusive education has, in the light of diversified classrooms, become a global semantics. This topic is addressed by numerous studies and strategic texts by international stakeholders, resulting in frameworks such as the UDL (Universal Design for Learning). Differentiation aims to enable teachers to respond to diverse learners' needs (UNESCO, 2019c). The resulting principles, which seek to overcome barriers to inclusionary learning processes, apply particularly to curricula and textbooks.

On the whole, the analysis of the sample examined here has shown that the inclusionary aspect has become increasingly significant both in terms of structure and subject matter, and particularly in the context of human rights and citizenship. Social diversity is also increasingly taken into account and reflected upon, albeit with varying emphasis on the different dimensions of diversity, given that genuinely intersectional perspectives via which these are linked only occur in isolated and rudimentary cases. With regard to inclusiveness in the gender-related dimension, the overall picture of the textbook sample under analysis here is a heterogeneous one; further, the incorporation of LGBTQIA+ perspectives remains at a deficit. Beyond this, the textbooks examined here do feature increased critical reflection on the societal discrimination of various groups, and, ultimately, a significant trend towards a more pronounced consideration and representation of different social groups and minorities.

7. BIBLIOGRAPHY

- Chisholm, L. 2018. Representations of Class, Race, and Gender in Textbooks. Fuchs, E. and Bock, A. (eds), *The Palgrave Handbook of Textbook Studies*. London, UK, Palgrave Macmillan, p.225-237.
- Blumberg, R.L. 2015. Eliminating gender bias in textbooks: Pushing for policy reforms that promote gender equity in education. Paris, UNESCO.
- Bromley, P. and Lerch, J. 2018. Humans Rights as Cultural Globalisation: The Rise of Human Rights in Textbooks, 1890-2013. Fuchs, E. and Bock, A. (eds), *The Palgrave Handbook of Textbook Studies*. London, UK, Palgrave Macmillan, pp. 345-356.
- Engel, L. C. 2016. Defining and Debating the Common "We". Analyses of Citizen Formation Beyond the Nation-State Mold. Williams, J. H. and Bokhorst-Heng, W. D. (eds), *(Re)Constructing Memory: Textbooks, Identity, Nation, and State*. Rotterdam, Netherlands, p. 345-353.
- Höhne, M.S. and Heerdegen, D. 2018. On Normativity and Absence: Representation of LGBTI* in Textbook Research. Fuchs, E. and Bock, A. (eds), *The Palgrave Handbook of Textbook Studies*. London, UK, Palgrave Macmillan, p. 239-249
- IBE. 2016. *Global Monitoring of Global Citizenship Education and Education for Sustainable Development: Themes in School Curricula*. Paris, UNESCO.

- Losito, B., Agrusti, G., Damiani, V. and Schulz, W. 2016. *Young People's Perceptions of Europe in a Time of Change: IEA International Civic and Citizenship Education Study 2016 European Report*. Amsterdam, International Association for the Evaluation of Educational Achievement.
- Niehaus, I. 2018. How Diverse Are Our Textbooks? Research Findings in International Perspective. Fuchs, E. and Bock, A. (eds), *The Palgrave Handbook of Textbook Studies*. London, UK, Palgrave Macmillan, p.329-343.
- Olsen, T. A. 2017. Colonial Conflicts: Absence, Inclusion and Indigenization in Textbook Presentations of Indigenous Peoples. Lewis, J. R., Andreassen, B.-O., Thobro, S. A. (eds), *Textbook Violence*. Sheffield, UK, Equinox, p.71-86.
- Pogorzelska, M. 2016. Creating an image of people with disabilities in formal education. Analysis of the textbooks used in the chosen European countries. *Studies in Global Ethics and Global Education*, Vol. 5, pp. 28-38.
- Reichenberg, M. 2017: The Representation of Type of Disability, Ethnicity and Age and How These Are Associated with Participation in Textbooks. *Journal of Special Education and Rehabilitation*, Vol. 18, No. 3-4, pp. 72-90.
- Sen, A. 1999: *Development as Freedom*. Oxford: Oxford University Press.
- Spreen, C. A. and Monaghan, C. 2016. History and Civic Education in the Rainbow Nation. Citizenship, Identity, and Xenophobia in the New South Africa. Williams, J. H. and Bokhorst-Heng, W. D. (eds), *(Re)Constructing Memory: Textbooks, Identity, Nation, and State*. Rotterdam, Netherlands, p. 199-217.
- UNESCO. 2015. *Gender and EFA 2000-2015: Achievements and Challenges – Gender Summary*. EFA Global Monitoring Report 2015. Paris, UNESCO.
- _____. 2016a. *Global Monitoring Report 2016: Gender Review - Creating sustainable futures for all*. Paris, UNESCO.
- _____. 2016b. *Textbooks Pave the Way to Sustainable Development*. Paris, UNESCO. (GEM Report Policy Paper 28.)
- _____. 2016c. *Out in the open: Education sector responses to violence based on sexual orientation and gender identity/expression*. Paris, UNESCO.
- _____. 2017a. *Making textbook content inclusive: A focus on religion, gender, and culture*. Paris, UNESCO.
- _____. 2017b. *Ensuring the right to equitable and inclusive quality education: results of the ninth consultation of Member States on the implementation of the UNESCO Convention and Recommendation against Discrimination in Education*. Paris, UNESCO.
- _____. 2018a: *Global Education Monitoring Report 2019: Migration, Displacement and Education - Building Bridges, not Walls*. Paris, UNESCO.
- _____. 2018b. *Global Education Monitoring Report: Gender Review 2018 – Meeting Our Commitments to Gender Equality in Education*. Paris, UNESCO.
- _____. 2018c. *School-related violence and bullying on the basis of Sexual Orientation and Gender Identity or Expression (SOGIE): Synthesis Report on China, the Philippines, Thailand and Viet Nam*. Paris, UNESCO.
- _____. 2018d. *GEM Report summary on disabilities and education*. Paris, UNESCO.

- ____. 2019a. *Report of the regional training for Francophone Africa. Cracking the code: Quality, gender-responsive STEM education*. Paris, UNESCO.
- ____. 2019b. *Global education monitoring report – Gender report: Building Bridges for gender equality*. Paris, UNESCO.
- ____. 2019c. N for nose. *State of the Education Report for India 2019: Children with Disabilities*. New Delhi, UNESCO.

8. BACKGROUND DATA

1. Argentina

Title of textbook: Educaciòn Ciudadana (2 Bde.)

Author(s): María Martina Sosa, Marcelo Eugenio Lucarini, Valeria Silvina Pita et al

Place of publication: Buenos Aires

Date (year) of publication: 2016/2017

Publisher: doceOrcasediciones

Subject discipline: Civic Education

Age group: 15 – 16

School year / grade: 9th and 10th

2. Australia

Title of textbook: Oxford Big Ideas: Economics & Business / Civics & Citizenship, 9&10 Australian Curriculum

Author(s): Joanne Wilson, Annie Wilson

Place of publication: Melbourne

Date (year) of publication: 2016 (1st Edition)

Publisher: Oxford University Press

Subject discipline: Economics / Civics

Age group: 14 – 16 (?)

School year / grade: 9th and 10th

3. Bahrain

Title of textbook: Citizenship Education (At-tarbiyah al-muwātanah); 3rd grade, middle school of the Bahrain Curriculum

Author(s): Not ascertainable

Place of publication: Not ascertainable

Date (year) of publication: 2017 (5th Edition)

Publisher: Ministry of Education, Bahrain

Subject discipline: Civics

Age group: 14 – 15

School year / grade: 9th (3rd grade, middle school of the Bahrain Curriculum)

4. Brazil

Title of textbook: Expedições Geográficas – 7^o ano (7th grade)

Author(s): Melhem Adas/Sérgio Adas

Place of publication: São Paulo

Date (year) of publication: 2015 (2nd Edition) – currently used in State Schools.

Publisher: Moderna

Subject discipline: Geography Age group: 12 – 13 years old

School year / grade: 6th – 9th (Collection)

5. Cameroon

Title of textbook: Education à la citoyenneté

Author(s): Michel Biock, Esther Boupda, Suzanne Judith Etong Ateba, Bernard Dijiomou

Place of publication: ?

Date (year) of publication: 2009

Publisher: Afrédit. Africaine d'Édition

Subject discipline: Education Civique

Age group: 14 – 16

School year / grade: 9th and 10th

6. Canada

Title of textbook: Civics in Action: In Your Communities, Across Canada, and Globally.

Author(s): Matthew Biggley, John Broomfield, Michelle Forde, Sandra Kritzer, Jaden Lairson

Place of publication: Whitby (Ontario)

Date (year) of publication: 2014

Publisher: McGraw-Hill Ryerson

Subject discipline: Civics

Age group: 15-16 ?

School year / grade: probably 10th ?

7. China

Title of textbook: *Morality and Law* for the second semester of Grade 8 Chinese Curriculum

Author(s): Textbook Compilation group of Ministry of Education

Place of publication: Beijing

Date (year) of publication: 2017 (1st Edition)

Publisher: People Education Press

Subject discipline: Law/ Civic

Age group: 14

School year / grade: 8th

8. Croatia

Title of the school textbook: Politics and Economy / Politik und Wirtschaft

Authors: Đuro Benić und Nataša Vulić

Place of publication: Zagreb, Croatia

Date/year of publication: 2014 (1st edition)

Publisher: Školska knjiga (*Schoolbook*)

Subject/discipline: Politics and Economy

Age group: 17/18

Schools year/grade: 12th grade (only "Gymnasium")

9. Egypt

Title of textbook: My Nation, my Life; Social Studies; World Geography and History of Modern Egypt (Waṭanī Ḥayātī, Ad-dirāshāt al-iğtimā'īya, ġuğrāfiyat al-'ālam wa-tārīḥ Misr al-ḥadīth)/ 3rd grade, middle school of the Egyptian Curriculum, volume 2

Author(s): Muḥammad Maḥsūb, Aḥmad Šalabī, Muḥammad ‘abd al-Hādī, Aḥmad ‘Abd Allāh, Ismā‘īl Zain ad-Dīn, Marwah Ṭaha, Muḥammad Ḥaṭṭāb, Muḥammad Maṣṣūr

Place of publication: Not ascertainable

Date (year) of publication: 2017/2018

Publisher: Not ascertainable

Subject discipline: Economics /History/ Civics

Age group: 14 – 15 (?)

School year / grade: 3rd grade, middle school of the Egyptian Curriculum

10. France

Title of textbook: Education civique

Author(s): Marc Germanangue, Sophie Bocher-Meunier, Renaud Farella, Laurent Thernisien

Place of publication: Paris

Date (year) of publication: 2012

Publisher: Belin

Subject discipline: Education Civique

Age group: 15 – 16

School year / grade: 9th and 10th

11. Germany

Title of textbook: Demokratie heute: Sozialkunde. Mecklenburg-Vorpommern, Sachsen-Anhalt, Thüringen

Author(s): Dieter Deiseroth, Heinz-Ulrich Wolf

Place of publication: Braunschweig

Date (year) of publication: 2018

Publisher: Westermann Gruppe

Subject discipline: Gemeinschaftskunde, Politik, Sozialkunde (Civics)

Age group: 13-16

School year / grade: 8th – 10th

12. India

Title of textbook: Democratic Politics I: Textbook in Political Science for Class IX

Author(s): A Team of Authors with Yogendra Yadav & Subhas Palshikar as the Chief Advisors

Place of publication: New Delhi, India

Date (year) of publication: 2019.

Publisher: National Council of Educational Research & Training, New Delhi.

Subject discipline: Social Science

Age group: 14 – 15

School year / grade: 9th

13. Indonesia

Title of textbook: Pendidikan Pancasila dan Kewarganegaraan untuk SMA/MA Kelas X [Pancasila Education and Citizenship]

Author(s): Yuyus Kardiman, Tuty and Alam S.

Editor(s): Ika Wijayanti and Hadiyansyah

Place of publication: Jakarta

Date (year) of publication: 2013 (1st Edition)

Publisher: Penerbit Erlangga

Subject discipline: Civics

Age group: ca. 15 – 18

School year / grade: 10th grade

14. Israel

Title of textbook: Lehiyot Ezrahim bi-Yisra'el – ba-Medina Yehudit ve-Demokratit (Being Citizens in Israel – in a Jewish and Democratic State)

Author(s): Varda Ashkenazi, Blaha Alferon, Tamir Dubi, Dana Starkman

Place of publication: Jerusalem

Date (year) of publication: 2016

Publisher: Ministry of Education

Subject discipline: Civics

Age group: 16-18

School year / grade: 10th to 12th Class

15. Japan

Title of textbook: Civics - New Social Studies (new version)

Author(s): Yasutoshi SAKAUE, Koji TONAMI, Noritaka YAGASAKI and 45 co-authors

Place of publication: Tokyo

Date (year) of publication: 10th Feb. 2016

Publisher: Tokyo Shoseki

Subject discipline: civics

Age group: 14-15

School year / grade: 9th

16. Mexico

Title of textbook: Ciudadanos des siglo XXI. Formación civica y ética 2

Author(s): Alfredo Juan Arnaud Bobadilla, Jessica Banos Poo, Adrian Enrique de Cerón Anaya

Place of publication: Mexico City

Date (year) of publication: 2019

Publisher: Siglo Veintiuno

Subject discipline: Civic Education

Age group: 15 – 16

School year / grade: 9th and 10th

17. New Zealand

Title of textbook: Diversity

Author(s): Nicholas Fitness

Place of publication: Melbourne, Australia / Albany, New Zealand

Date (year) of publication: 2016 (1st Edition)

Publisher: Nelson Cengage Learning

Subject discipline: Diversity (Social Studies)

Age group: 14 – 16 (?)

School year / grade: 9th and 10th

18. Nigeria

Title of textbook: Essential Civic education for Senior Secondary Schools (SS1, SS2 & SS3), Book one (SS1) p. 1-77

Author(s): Gbenga M. Babalola, Igbinobu Chuks

Place of publication: Ibafo, Ogun State

Date (year) of publication: 2015 (2nd edition)

Publisher: Tonad Publishers Ltd.

Subject discipline: Civic education

Age group: 14-17

School year / grade: Senior Secondary School 1, 2 and 3

19. Norway

Title of textbook: Nye Makt og Menneske. 10 Samfunnskunnskap (Bokmål)

Author(s): Tarjei Helland

Place of publication: Oslo

Date (year) of publication: 2016

Publisher: Cappelen Damm

Subject discipline: Social studies

Age group: 14-16

School year / grade: 7-10

20. Palestine

Title of textbook: Social Studies

Author(s): Amin Abu-Baker, khamis Alafifi, Nazih Aladra, Jihan Dababat, Samar Kaakour, Suhair Altamimi.

Place of publication: Ramallah.

Date (year) of publication: 2019 (second edition)

Publisher: Markaz Almanahaj (Ministry of Education)

Subject discipline: Social Studies/Civics

Age group: 14 – 16 (?)

School year / grade: 9th

21. Peru

Title of textbook: Formación Ciudadana y Cívica

Author(s): Cecilia Mejía, Ada Munoz, Juan Fonseca et al

Place of publication: Lima

Date (year) of publication: 2014

Publisher: Santillana

Subject discipline: Civic Education

Age group: 15 – 16

School year / grade: 9th and 10th

22. Romania

Title of textbook: Educație Socială, Manual pentru clasa a VII-a (Social Education, Textbook for 7th grade)

Author(s): Daniela Barbu, Anuța Bondar, Cătălina Neagu, Stan Stoica

Place of publication: București

Date (year) of publication: 2019 (1st Edition)

Publisher: CD Press

Subject discipline: Economics / Civics

Age group: 13-14 y.o.

School year / grade: 7

23. Russian Federation

Title of textbook: Social Studies (Обществознание [Obshestvoznaniye])

Author(s): edited by Bogolyubov L.N., Lazebnikova A.Yu., Matveev A.I.

Place of publication: Moskow

Date (year) of publication: 2018 (5st Edition)

Publisher: Prosvesheniye

Subject discipline: Civics

Age group:

School year / grade: 9th

24. South Africa

Title of textbook: Spot on: Life Orientation. Grade 9, Learner's Book

Author(s): Zara Bromfield, Marleen Carstens, Anton Pretorius, Philip Vercueil, Colleen Walls

Place of publication: Cape Town

Date (year) of publication: 2013 (1st Edition)

Publisher: Pearson Marang Ltd.

Subject discipline: Life Orientation (Social Studies / Physical Education / Health Education)

Age group: 14-15?

School year / grade: 9th

25. Spain

Title of textbook: Educación para la Ciudadanía y los Derechos Humanos

Author(s): P. Navarro Sustaeta, C. Diaz Martinez

Place of publication: Madrid

Date (year) of publication: 2012

Publisher: ANAYA

Subject discipline: Civic Education

Age group: 15 – 16

School year / grade: 9th and 10th

26. Sweden

Title of textbook: Reflex 123. Samhällkunskap for Gymnasieskolan

Author(s): Hans Almgren, Stefan Höjelid, Erik, Nilsson, Anna Furevik

Place of publication: Malmö

Date (year) of publication: 2018

Publisher: Gleerups Utbildning AB

Subject discipline: Social studies

Age group: 16-18

School year / grade: 11/12

27. United Kingdom

Title of textbook: Citizenship Studies AQA GCSE (9-1)

Author(s): Mike Mitchell

Place of publication: London

Date (year) of publication: 2016

Publisher: Hodder Education, an Hachette UK Company

Subject discipline: Citizenship Studies

Age group: 14 - 16

School year / grade: key stage 4

28. United States

Title of textbook: Building Citizenship: Civics & Economics

Author(s): Richard C. Remy, John J. Patrick, David C. Saffell, Gary E. Clayton

Place of publication: Columbus, Ohio

Date (year) of publication: 2018

Publisher: McGraw-Hill Education

Subject discipline: Civics / Economics

Age group: -

School year / grade: for the complete ISCED 2 level

9. List of potential case studies

Selection criteria

- Geographical diversity
- Good practice examples
- Country categories (in relation to minorities)

From the analysis:

| | Good Practice | Country categories |
|--------------|------------------------|--------------------|
| Germany | 4.2, 4.3. | 5 |
| Romania | 4.3., 4.4. | 3 |
| Canada | 4.1. 4.2., 4.3., 4.4. | 1 |
| South Africa | 4.2., 4.3., 4.4., 4.5. | 2 |
| Iran | | 4 |
| India | 4.5. | 3 |
| Indonesia | 4.1., 4.2. | 3 and 4 |
| Australia | 4.1., 4.2., 4.3. | 1 |
| Rep. Korea | | X |
| Mexico | 4.1., 4.2. | 1 and 5 |

Levels of analysis

- Curricula
- 20 textbooks per country
- Secondary school level
- Subjects: history, social studies/civics, geography, mathematics