

## **PEER REVIEW TEAM REPORT**

Crafton Hills College  
11711 Sand Canyon Road  
Yucaipa, CA 92399

This report represents the findings of the Peer Review Team that conducted a virtual visit to Crafton Hills College from October 12, 2020 to October 15, 2020. The Commission acted on the accredited status of the institution during its January 2021 meeting and this team report must be reviewed in conjunction with the Commission's Action letter.

Dr. Timothy Karas  
Team Chair

**Contents**

Summary of Peer Review Team Report ..... 6

Team Commendations ..... 8

Team Recommendations..... 8

Introduction..... 9

Eligibility Requirements ..... 11

Checklist for Evaluating Compliance with Federal Regulations and Related Commission Policies..... 13

    Public Notification of an Peer Review Team Visit and Third Party Comment..... 13

    Standards and Performance with Respect to Student Achievement ..... 14

    Credits, Program Length, and Tuition ..... 15

    Transfer Policies ..... 16

    Distance Education and Correspondence Education ..... 17

    Student Complaints..... 18

    Institutional Disclosure and Advertising and Recruitment Materials..... 19

    Title IV Compliance ..... 20

Standard I ..... 21

    I.A. Mission ..... 21

    I.B. Assuring Academic Quality and Institutional Effectiveness ..... 22

    I.C. Institutional Integrity ..... 28

Standard II..... 29

    II.A. Instructional Programs ..... 29

    II.B. Library and Learning Support Services..... 34

    II.C. Student Support Services..... 36

Standard III ..... 39

    III.A. Human Resources ..... 39

    III.B. Physical Resources ..... 42

    III.C. Technology Resources ..... 43

    III.D. Financial Resources ..... 46

Standard IV ..... 49

    IV.A. Decision-Making Roles & Processes..... 49

    IV.B. Chief Executive Officer ..... 52

    IV.C. Governing Board..... 54

    IV.D. Multi-College Districts or Systems..... 57

Quality Focus Essay..... 60



**Crafton Hills College  
Comprehensive Peer Review Visit  
Peer Review Team Roster**

Dr. Timothy Karas, Team Chair  
Mendocino College  
Superintendent/President

Ms. Minerva Flores, Team Assistant  
Mendocino College  
Director of Institutional Effectiveness, Research, Equity and Grants

**ACADEMIC MEMBERS**

Dr. Scott Lukas  
Lake Tahoe Community College  
Faculty Chair of Teaching and Learning

Dr. Deborah Nolan  
College of the Sequoias  
Faculty Distance Education Coordinator

Ms. Maryanne Mills  
West Valley College  
Instruction and Outreach Librarian

Ms. P. Jayne Bopp  
Leeward Community College  
Coordinator Institutional Research Office/ALO

Dr. Paul Murphy  
Allan Hancock College  
Vice President of Institutional Effectiveness

Dr. Lisa Cooper Wilkins  
San Joaquin Delta College  
Assistant Superintendent/Vice President of Student Services

**ADMINISTRATIVE MEMBERS**

Dr. Theresa Fleischer Rowland  
Chabot-Las Positas Community College District  
Vice Chancellor, Educational Services & Student Success

Ms. Chedva Weingart  
Pasadena City College  
Executive Director, Fiscal Services

**ACCJC STAFF LIAISON**

Ms. Gohar Momjian

Vice President, ACCJC

## Summary of Peer Review Team Report

INSTITUTION: Crafton Hills College

DATES OF VISIT: October 12-15, 2020

TEAM CHAIR: Dr. Timothy Karas

A ten member accreditation team conducted a virtual visit to Crafton Hills College on October 12-15, 2020 for the purpose of determining whether the College continues to meet Accreditation Standards, Eligibility Requirements, Commission Policies, and USDE regulations.

ACCJC's decision to conduct virtual visits for the fall 2020 comprehensive reviews was based upon the Commission's authority to implement flexibilities to accreditation processes and practices afforded by the federal government in response to the COVID-19 pandemic. Specifically, the U.S. Department of Education's March 17, 2020 guidance, as well as all updates, permitted accreditors to perform virtual site visits for institutions as long as the accreditor follows up with an onsite visit in a reasonable amount of time to meet the statutory and regulatory requirements (though not necessarily a full peer-review site visit).

Consistent with on-site visits, and in accordance with the Guide for Conducting Virtual Visits: An Addendum for Peer Review Team Chairs, Team Members, and Colleges that ACCJC provided to team chairs, peer reviewers, and Colleges being reviewed, the virtual peer review team visit to Crafton Hills College relied on an engaged and interactive format, conducting multiple interviews with College representatives, participating in team meetings to discuss findings, and conducting the required campus forums. The team evaluated how well the College is achieving its stated purposes, providing recommendations for quality assurance and institutional improvement.

In preparation for the visit, the team chair attended via Zoom a team chair training workshop on August 4, 2020 and held a pre-visit meeting with the College CEO on September 12, 2020. The entire peer review team received team training provided by staff from ACCJC via Zoom on September 3, 2020.

The peer review team received the College's self-evaluation document (ISER) and related evidence several weeks prior to the team's virtual College visit. Team members found the ISER to be a comprehensive, well written, document detailing the processes used by the College to address Eligibility Requirements, Commission Standards, and Commission Policies. The team confirmed that the ISER was developed through broad participation by the entire College community including faculty, staff, students, and administration. The team found that the College provided a thoughtful ISER containing several self-identified action plans for institutional improvement. The College also prepared a Quality Focus Essay.

Prior to the virtual visit, team members completed their team assignments, identified areas for further investigation, and provided a list of interview requests. The College kicked off the

virtual visit by holding an opening meeting on October 12, 2020. During the visit, team members met with approximately eighty faculty, administrators, classified staff and students in formal meetings, group interviews and individual interviews. Team members met with two trustees from the College and observed a board meeting. The team held two open forums, which were well-attended, and provided the College community and others to share their thoughts with members of the evaluation team. The team thanks the College staff for coordinating and hosting the virtual visit meetings and interviews and ensuring a smooth process which held high standards for the integrity of the peer review process.

## **Major Findings and Recommendations of the Peer Review Team Report**

### **Recommendations to Improve Quality:**

#### Recommendation 1:

In order to improve institutional effectiveness, the team recommends the College ensures that the Program Planning Review process is implemented consistently across all of the learning support and student support service areas. (II.B.3, II.C.2)



## Introduction

Crafton Hills College (CHC) has been in continuous operation since 1972. Crafton Hills College serves the people in the eastern part of the San Bernardino Valley. Crafton Hills College is part of a multi-College District, the San Bernardino Community College District (SBCCD). SBCCD is comprised of Crafton Hills College and San Bernardino Valley College.

Since its founding, Crafton Hills College has grown from a small to medium sized community College. CHC's enrollment now exceeds 9,000 students annually, an increase largely stemming from the population growth in recent years. CHC experienced an increase not only in enrollment but also in the number of completions. In the 2018-2019 academic year, the College had the highest number of degree and certificate awards in the College's 50-year history.

Due to the COVID pandemic, the entire site visit was completed utilizing online platforms. Interviews were conducted virtually, and evidence was shared electronically, and introduction and exit forums held online. Crafton Hills College has experienced single digit enrollment decline in fall 2020 compared to fall 2019.

The College has put into place several measures to serve students and offer instructional programs. These included facility adjustments, such as, distribution of PPE; the installation of indoor air HEPA filters throughout the campus for use by individual departments; installation of hand sanitizer pedestal dispensers at entrances to all occupied areas; developed and installed COVID signage throughout campus; and custodial has "deep" cleaned and sanitized all areas of the campus. Instruction enacted an emergency remote instruction taskforce; dramatically increasing the number of faculty trained in online teaching and accessibility; provided online tutoring available evenings and weekends; and developed faculty and student resource pages to support faculty and students. Student services converted many hardcopy files and forms to electronic versions; fully adopted Cranium Café in all Student Services Departments; and hosted online student government elections and a virtual commencement ceremony. The institution created a virtual campus tour video for students to learn how to access services; made the emergency assistance grant form available online; and increased communication to students with weekly emails about chrome books/hotspots, emergency assistance grants, CARES funding, online services, workshops, activities, and resources.

During the evaluation visit, team members conducted interviews, meetings, and observations involving College employees, students, board members, and community members. Two open forums provided the College community with opportunities to provide feedback, comments, and perspectives regarding the College to the evaluation team. The two public forums were well attended and very positive. The comments illustrated the pride many of the faculty, staff and students have in their College. Words used to describe CHC were student-centered, team effort, selflessness, intentional, interdisciplinary collaboration, inclusion, and innovation.

The team reviewed numerous materials supporting the self-evaluation report, which included documents and evidence relating to the Standards, Eligibility Requirements, Commission Policies, and USDE regulations. Evidence reviewed by the team included, but was not limited to, documents such as institutional plans, strategic planning documents, program review procedures and reports, student learning outcomes evidence, course syllabi, distance education classes, College policies and procedures, enrollment and student success information, committee minutes and materials, and governance structures.

The team greatly appreciated the organization and hospitality the College showed during the visit. The team appreciated the assistance of key staff members, especially the accreditation liaison officer, who assisted the team with requests for individual meetings and additional evidence throughout the evaluation process. It was unique to conduct an entire visit virtually.

Of the many gems at CHC, the team applauds the work to transform the English and Math sequences to improve student success, and the college's efforts to support equity and inclusion, and mental health services. The team was impressed by the College's guided pathways work, distance education training and verification process, and use of qualitative and quantitative data for decision making. Lastly, during the pandemic, the real time change and adaptability the College demonstrated is noteworthy.

## **Eligibility Requirements**

### **1. Authority**

The team confirms that Crafton Hills College is authorized to operate as a post-secondary, degree-granting institution based on continuous accreditation by the Accrediting Commission for Community and Junior Colleges (ACCJC) of the Western Association of Schools and Colleges (WASC).

In addition, the College operates under the authority of the State of California Education Code, which establishes the California community College system under the leadership and direction of the Board of Governors (State of California Education Code 70900-70901).

The College meets the ER.

### **2. Operational Status**

The team confirmed that Crafton Hills College is operational and provides educational services to 9,427 unduplicated student enrollments (annualized) within degree applicable credit courses for the period of the 2018-19 Academic Year

The College meets the ER.

### **3. Degrees**

The team confirmed that 94 percent of Crafton Hills College's course sections in fall 2019 were credit sections in programs that lead to degrees. In the same year, Crafton Hills conferred 776 associate degrees and 571 certificates.

The College meets the ER.

### **4. Chief Executive Officer**

The team confirmed that the Board of Trustees employs a Chancellor as the chief executive officer of the San Bernardino Community College District (SBCCD) that has direct oversight to the President of Crafton Hills College. The President of Crafton Hills College serves as the chief executive officer of the College and was appointed by the SBCCD Board of Trustees in January 2019. The CEO does not serve as a member of the Board of Trustees nor as the board president. The team found that the Board of Trustees delegates authority to the SBCCD Chancellor and Crafton Hills College President to administer board policies and implement administrative procedures.

The College meets the ER.

## **5. Financial Accountability**

The evaluation team confirmed that Crafton Hills College within the San Bernardino Community College District performs audits for all financial records, which are conducted by an independent accounting firm. Audit reports are certified, findings and associated District/College responses are appropriately documented. Audits for FY 2017-18, FY 2018-19, and FY 2019-20 note District compliance with federal programs.

The College meets the ER.

## Checklist for Evaluating Compliance with Federal Regulations and Related Commission Policies

The evaluation items detailed in this Checklist are those which fall specifically under federal regulations and related Commission policies, beyond what is articulated in the Accreditation Standards; other evaluation items under ACCJC standards may address the same or similar subject matter. The peer review team evaluated the institution's compliance with Standards as well as the specific Checklist elements from federal regulations and related Commission policies noted here.

### **Public Notification of an Peer Review Team Visit and Third Party Comment**

#### **Evaluation Items:**

<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	The institution has made an appropriate and timely effort to solicit third party comment in advance of a comprehensive evaluation visit.
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	The institution cooperates with the evaluation team in any necessary follow-up related to the third party comment.
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	The institution demonstrates compliance with the <i>Commission Policy on Rights and Responsibilities of the Commission and Member Institutions</i> as to third party comment.

[Regulation citation: 602.23(b).]

#### **Conclusion Check-Off (mark one):**

<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	The team has reviewed the elements of this component and has found the institution to meet the Commission's requirements.
<input type="checkbox"/>	The team has reviewed the elements of this component and has found the institution to meet the Commission's requirements, but that follow-up is recommended.
<input type="checkbox"/>	The team has reviewed the elements of this component and found the institution does not meet the Commission's requirements.

#### **Narrative:**

The College has provided opportunities for third-party comment in advance of the team visit. Crafton Hills College has published the process for third-party comment on its website. The Commission did not receive any third-party comments.

**Standards and Performance with Respect to Student Achievement**

**Evaluation Items:**

<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	The institution has defined elements of student achievement performance across the institution and has identified the expected measure of performance within each defined element. Course completion is included as one of these elements of student achievement. Other elements of student achievement performance for measurement have been determined as appropriate to the institution’s mission. (Standard I.B.3 and Section B. Presentation of Student Achievement Data and Institution-set Standards)
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	The institution has defined elements of student achievement performance within each instructional program and has identified the expected measure of performance within each defined element. The defined elements include, but are not limited to, job placement rates for program completers, and for programs in fields where licensure is required, the licensure examination passage rates for program completers. (Standard I.B.3 and Section B. Presentation of Student Achievement Data and Institution-set Standards)
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	The institution-set standards for programs and across the institution are relevant to guide self-evaluation and institutional improvement; the defined elements and expected performance levels are appropriate within higher education; the results are reported regularly across the campus; and the definition of elements and results are used in program-level and institution-wide planning to evaluate how well the institution fulfills its mission, to determine needed changes, to allocating resources, and to make improvements. (Standard I.B.3, Standard I.B.9)
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	The institution analyzes its performance as to the institution-set standards and as to student achievement and takes appropriate measures in areas where its performance is not at the expected level. (Standard I.B.4)

[Regulation citations: 602.16(a)(1)(i); 602.17(f); 602.19 (a-e).]

**Conclusion Check-Off (mark one):**

<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	The team has reviewed the elements of this component and has found the institution to meet the Commission’s requirements.
<input type="checkbox"/>	The team has reviewed the elements of this component and has found the institution to meet the Commission’s requirements, but that follow-up is recommended.
<input type="checkbox"/>	The team has reviewed the elements of this component and found the institution does not meet the Commission’s requirements.

**Narrative:**

Using internal dialogues involving all stakeholders, Crafton Hills College has self-identified elements of student achievement performance across the institution as appropriate to its mission and has identified the metrics pertinent to each element. The Institutional Set Standards matrix

compiles the College’s tracked metrics over a 5-year period, the defined baseline for each parameter. Each metric includes a stretch goal above the baseline standard. One of the tracked metrics is that of student completion. Additionally, tracked in programs to which they apply are job placement rates and licensure examination pass rates. The metrics are analyzed and used by departments and programs to continuously improve student learning and student success.

**Credits, Program Length, and Tuition**

**Evaluation Items:**

<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	Credit hour assignments and degree program lengths are within the range of good practice in higher education (in policy and procedure). (Standard II.A.9)
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	The assignment of credit hours and degree program lengths is verified by the institution, and is reliable and accurate across classroom based courses, laboratory classes, distance education classes, and for courses that involve clinical practice (if applicable to the institution). (Standard II.A.9)
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	Tuition is consistent across degree programs (or there is a rational basis for any program-specific tuition). (Standard I.C.2)
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	Any clock hour conversions to credit hours adhere to the Department of Education’s conversion formula, both in policy and procedure, and in practice. (Standard II.A.9)
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	The institution demonstrates compliance with the Commission <i>Policy on Institutional Degrees and Credits</i> .

[Regulation citations: 600.2 (definition of credit hour); 602.16(a)(1)(viii); 602.24(e), (f); 668.2; 668.9.]

**Conclusion Check-Off (mark one):**

<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	The team has reviewed the elements of this component and has found the institution to meet the Commission’s requirements.
<input type="checkbox"/>	The team has reviewed the elements of this component and has found the institution to meet the Commission’s requirements, but that follow-up is recommended.
<input type="checkbox"/>	The team has reviewed the elements of this component and found the institution does not meet the Commission’s requirements.

**Narrative:**

Crafton Hills College awards credit for courses, degrees, and certificates in a manner consistent with standard practices in higher education and in compliance with state and federal law. The College Curriculum Committee and the Office of Instruction appropriately implement Course credit calculations as described in the California Community College Chancellor’s Office (CCCCO) Program Course Approval Handbook.

The Curriculum Committee and the Office of Instruction verify the credit hours and degree program lengths as part of their review process of courses and programs. Course credits are assigned based on the number of lecture and lab hours and other performance criteria specified in the Course Outline of Record.

Enrollment fees and tuition per unit are published in the College Catalog, including enrollment fees and tuition for special programs and tuition for non-residents and international students.

The College determines credit hours based on policies and procedures that align with standard practices in higher education. One unit of credit in a lecture course represents between 16-18 hours of coursework and one unit of credit in a lab course represents between 48-54 hours of course work. The academic year spans at least 30 weeks (Crafton Hills College has a 34-week academic year), and a full-time student enrolls at least in 12 units per semester.

**Transfer Policies**

**Evaluation Items:**

<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	Transfer policies are appropriately disclosed to students and to the public. (Standard II.A.10)
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	Policies contain information about the criteria the institution uses to accept credits for transfer. (Standard II.A.10)
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	The institution complies with the Commission <i>Policy on Transfer of Credit</i> .

[Regulation citations: 602.16(a)(1)(viii); 602.17(a)(3); 602.24(e); 668.43(a)(ii).]

**Conclusion Check-Off (mark one):**

<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	The team has reviewed the elements of this component and has found the institution to meet the Commission’s requirements.
<input type="checkbox"/>	The team has reviewed the elements of this component and has found the institution to meet the Commission’s requirements, but that follow-up is recommended.
<input type="checkbox"/>	The team has reviewed the elements of this component and found the institution does not meet the Commission’s requirements.

**Narrative:**

Transfer policies are disclosed to the students and the public in the Crafton Hills College Catalog, which is also available on the website. Articulation agreements are founded on quality education by meeting the academic terms, standards, and CORs of the receiving institution. The College has Guarantee Admission Agreements with the CSU system. For the CSU, UC, and California Community College system, the Intersegmental General Education Transfer Curriculum (IGETC) articulation agreement includes general education courses and certain major courses. For UC system, the University of California Transfer Course Agreement (UCTCA) agreement serves as an evolving list of agreeably transferable courses.



**Distance Education and Correspondence Education**

**Evaluation Items:**

<b>For Distance Education:</b>	
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	The institution demonstrates regular and substantive interaction between students and the instructor.
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	The institution demonstrates comparable learning support services and student support services for distance education students. (Standards II.B.1, II.C.1)
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	The institution verifies that the student who registers in a distance education program is the same person who participates every time and completes the course or program and receives the academic credit.
<b>For Correspondence Education:</b>	
<input type="checkbox"/>	The institution demonstrates comparable learning support services and student support services for correspondence education students. (Standards II.B.1, II.C.1)
<input type="checkbox"/>	The institution verifies that the student who registers in a correspondence education program is the same person who participates every time and completes the course or program and receives the academic credit.
<b>Overall:</b>	
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	The technology infrastructure is sufficient to maintain and sustain the distance education and correspondence education offerings. (Standard III.C.1)
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	The institution demonstrates compliance with the Commission <i>Policy on Distance Education and Correspondence Education</i> .

[Regulation citations: 602.16(a)(1)(iv), (vi); 602.17(g); 668.38.]

**Conclusion Check-Off (mark one):**

<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	The team has reviewed the elements of this component and has found the institution to meet the Commission’s requirements.
<input type="checkbox"/>	The team has reviewed the elements of this component and has found the institution to meet the Commission’s requirements, but that follow-up is recommended.
<input type="checkbox"/>	The team has reviewed the elements of this component and found the Institution does not meet the Commission’s requirements.
<input type="checkbox"/>	The College does not offer Distance Education or Correspondence Education.

**Narrative:**

The team reviewed a sample of online courses from spring 2020 and examined evidence related to College Distance Education (DE) policies and procedures.

DE courses use a hosted learning management system supported by a flexible technology infrastructure designed to meet fluctuating demand. The College has a DE board policy and administrative procedure (BP/AP 4105) and committee structures and practices that support consistent application of the BP and AP.

College processes support compliance with the Commission Policy on Distance Education and Correspondence Education.

**Student Complaints**

**Evaluation Items:**

<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	The institution has clear policies and procedures for handling student complaints, and the current policies and procedures are accessible to students in the College catalog and online.
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	The student complaint files for the previous seven years (since the last comprehensive evaluation) are available; the files demonstrate accurate implementation of the complaint policies and procedures.
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	The team analysis of the student complaint files identifies any issues that may be indicative of the institution’s noncompliance with any Accreditation Standards.
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	The institution posts on its website the names of associations, agencies and governmental bodies that accredit, approve, or license the institution and any of its programs, and provides contact information for filing complaints with such entities. (Standard I.C.1)
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	The institution demonstrates compliance with the Commission <i>Policy on Representation of Accredited Status</i> and the <i>Policy on Student and Public Complaints Against Institutions</i> .

[Regulation citations: 602.16(a)(1)(ix); 668.43.]

**Conclusion Check-Off (mark one):**

<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	The team has reviewed the elements of this component and has found the institution to meet the Commission’s requirements.
<input type="checkbox"/>	The team has reviewed the elements of this component and has found the institution to meet the Commission’s requirements, but that follow-up is recommended.
<input type="checkbox"/>	The team has reviewed the elements of this component and found the institution does not meet the Commission’s requirements.

**Narrative:**

The College’s student grievance process is articulated in BP/AP 5530 and is published in the College Catalog.

The College maintains records on student complaints in the respective division offices. Records of formal complaint concerning harassment or discrimination are maintained in the Human Resources Office.

Anyone may file a complaint using a form available from the Crafton Hills College webpage through the “Contact Us” link. Once completed, this form is sent to the District Vice Chancellor of Human Resources, who initiates action to resolve the issue identified in the complaint if feasible.

On the main College webpage, under the “About Us” tab is a direct link to the Crafton Hills accreditation page. The accreditation webpage has a direct link to the ACCJC website, where anyone may file a complaint with ACCJC.

The Accreditation status of the College and its programs is appropriately represented on the College website.

**Institutional Disclosure and Advertising and Recruitment Materials**

**Evaluation Items:**

<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	The institution provides accurate, timely (current), and appropriately detailed information to students and the public about its programs, locations, and policies. (Standard I.C.2)
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	The institution complies with the Commission <i>Policy on Institutional Advertising, Student Recruitment, and Policy on Representation of Accredited Status</i> .
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	The institution provides required information concerning its accredited status.(Standard I.C.12)

[Regulation citations: 602.16(a)(1))(vii); 668.6.]

**Conclusion Check-Off (mark one):**

<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	The team has reviewed the elements of this component and has found the institution to meet the Commission’s requirements.
<input type="checkbox"/>	The team has reviewed the elements of this component and has found the institution to meet the Commission’s requirements, but that follow-up is recommended.
<input type="checkbox"/>	The team has reviewed the elements of this component and found the institution does not meet the Commission’s requirements.

**Narrative:**

Program descriptions and degree requirements, board policies, admissions policies, and center locations are all easily identifiable on the College website. The catalog details requirements for transfer, degrees, and certificates. Department pages list faculty, certificates/degrees offered, sequences for those certificates/degrees, and program completions. Under Admissions, the website lists academic policies and regulations including Standards of Conduct, Student Conduct, and Academic Honesty. In addition, the institution maintains current accreditation status on the website, welcomes community input on accreditation matters, and provides an archive of previous accreditation documents.

**Title IV Compliance**

**Evaluation Items:**

<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	The institution has presented evidence on the required components of the Title IV Program, including findings from any audits and program or other review activities by the USDE. (Standard III.D.15)
<input type="checkbox"/>	If applicable, the institution has addressed any issues raised by the USDE as to financial responsibility requirements, program record-keeping, etc. If issues were not timely addressed, the institution demonstrates it has the fiscal and administrative capacity to timely address issues in the future and to retain compliance with Title IV program requirements. (Standard III.D.15)
<input type="checkbox"/>	If applicable, the institution’s student loan default rates are within the acceptable range defined by the USDE. Remedial efforts have been undertaken when default rates near or meet a level outside the acceptable range. (Standard III.D.15)
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	If applicable, contractual relationships of the institution to offer or receive educational, library, and support services meet the Accreditation Standards and have been approved by the Commission through substantive change if required. (Standard III.D.16)
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	The institution demonstrates compliance with the Commission <i>Policy on Contractual Relationships with Non-Regionally Accredited Organizations</i> and the <i>Policy on Institutional Compliance with Title IV</i> .

[Regulation citations: 602.16(a)(1)(v); 602.16(a)(1)(x); 602.19(b); 668.5; 668.15; 668.16; 668.71 et seq.]

**Conclusion Check-Off:**

<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	The team has reviewed the elements of this component and has found the institution to meet the Commission’s requirements.
<input type="checkbox"/>	The team has reviewed the elements of this component and has found the institution to meet the Commission’s requirements, but that follow-up is recommended.
<input type="checkbox"/>	The team has reviewed the elements of this component and found the institution does not meet the Commission’s requirements.

## **Narrative:**

The College is in compliance with all Title IV requirements. An annual audit is performed by external auditors and it includes a complete review of Title IV compliance.

## **Standard I**

### **Mission, Academic Quality and Institutional Effectiveness**

#### **I.A. Mission**

##### General Observations:

The Crafton Hills College (CHC) mission, vision statement and statement of institutional values viewed in conjunction with the California Community Colleges Chancellor's Office mission defines the College's broad educational purposes and its commitment to student learning and student achievement. The College's Strategic Directions are used to articulate and implement the broad educational goals of the mission across all programs and services to support a diverse student population. CHC's programs and services are aligned with its mission. CHC demonstrates the use of data to determine how effectively it is accomplishing its mission including meeting the educational needs of students and intuitional student learning outcomes (SLOs), service area outcomes (SAOs) and program learning outcomes (PLOs). The institution's mission based assessment processes include a well-defined Comprehensive Master Plan and Program and Planning Review Process that help ensure that College governance and decision-making processes are data-driven and participatory in nature. The institution's mission guides institutional decision-making, planning, and informs institutional goals for student learning and achievement. CHC's mission is reviewed annually and widely publicized.

##### Findings and Evidence:

The team found that the College's mission statement and accompanying vision statement create a strong foundation for the institution's broad educational purposes. The intended student population is described and its open-access policy combined with its Student Equity Plan seek to meet the needs of an increasingly diverse student body. The mission describes the College's overall educational purposes. Detailed information on degrees and certificates offered is located in the College catalog and schedules. Crafton Hills' commitment to student learning and student achievement are referred to in their statement of institutional values where "Crafton Hills College values academic excellence, creativity and the advancement of each individual". (I.A.1)

The team verified that the College regularly collects data and makes it available to programs and services in order to determine how effectively it accomplishes its mission. The data are gathered annually and used in detailed reports that programs and services use to develop objectives. These objectives are measured annually to set institutional priorities and improve practices and processes towards meeting the mission and the educational needs of students. The College's Planning and Program Review (PPR) Committee uses a four-year cycle process to gather

prioritized objectives from programs and services based on collected data that is rolled up from the unit level to the respective administrative areas. (I.A.2)

The team found that CHC's programs and services are aligned with its mission. The Integrated Planning & Program Review Cycle emphasizes that Program Reviews must be aligned with the mission where units must describe their own mission and how it advances the mission of the College. The College's Instructional Program Review Evaluation Rubric measures how well a unit has aligned its mission with the College mission. The team found during the site visit that the PPR process includes resource allocation and prioritizing of resource requests. (I.A.3)

CHC reviews its mission statement annually and uses it as the basis for all of their planning activities. The mission is widely publicized including in the institution's website, College Catalog, and Faculty Handbook. The Educational Master Plan Committee, whose membership includes faculty, staff, administrators and student representatives is responsible for annually reviewing the College's mission, vision, and values. The last time the mission was reviewed it was determined that no changes were needed. The team found during the campus site visit that the mission was formally approved by CHC's governing board, the Board of Trustees in 2014. (I.A.4)

#### Conclusions:

The College meets the standard.

### **I.B. Assuring Academic Quality and Institutional Effectiveness**

#### General Observations:

Crafton Hills Colleges assures Academic Quality and Institutional Effectiveness through a robust program review process and planning structure. At the core of this effort is the Planning and Program Review Committee (PPRC), with strong faculty participation and enthusiasm. Guidance for the process is provided in the Crafton Hills College Integrated Planning & Program Review Handbook. Program reviews are conducted for both instructional and non-instructional programs on four-year timelines that include annual planning submissions.

The Educational Master Planning Committee (EMPC) provides oversight for development of the Education Master Plan and integration of long-range planning. Dialog about improving student equity occurs across campus and is infused in planning and decision-making, including program review data analysis and resource allocation. The College illustrates through examples the way that resource allocation is driven by student achievement and outcomes.

Crafton Hills College engages in continuous dialogue about student outcomes in relation to student equity, academic quality, and institutional effectiveness. Overall, the team found evidence that there is a focused attention on research, data-driven inquiry, and use of data to support improvement in student learning and achievement.

## Findings and Evidence:

Crafton Hills Colleges demonstrates a sustained, substantive and collegial dialog about student outcomes, student equity, academic quality, institutional effectiveness, and continuous improvement of student learning and achievement through the College's collegial governance committees. The Office of Institutional Effectiveness, Research, and Planning (OIERP) facilitates dialogue about student outcomes and ways to increase student success. This dialogue is facilitated by the Office of Institutional Effectiveness, Research, and Planning (OIERP) and emphasizes the concept the "learning College." Dialogue also occurs at College planning activities, such as the Annual Planning Retreat, educational master planning, and department plans developed during program review. (I.B.1)

Crafton Hills College defines and assesses student learning outcomes for all instructional programs and student and learning support services as evidences through review documents in SLO Cloud and Planning and Program Review Web Tool. The institution relies on a number of strategies to assess student learning outcomes (SLOs) in order to improve on student learning. Crafton Hills College has developed SLOs for all courses and degree and certificate programs, ILOs for six areas (critical thinking, written and oral communication, interpersonal and group skills, society and culture, information and literacy, and ethics and values), and it publishes outcomes information in a number of accessible fora, including the Catalog and SLO Cloud. (IB.2)

Crafton Hills College established its institutional-set standards for student achievement in 2013 and has reported its results to the ACCJC every year since then. Measures for these standards include successful course completion rates, fall-to-fall retention rates, number of transfers to a four-year College or university, and number of degrees and certificates awarded. CHC partnered with the Research and Planning Group for California Community Colleges (RP Group) to conduct focus groups which led to recommendations for the College to improve low course success rates among certain demographic groups. An action plan documenting the specific activities the College would engage in in response to these recommendations is in development and will be implemented in fall 2020. The College also regularly reviews its progress on its stretch goals or the Crafton Hills College Scorecard and Vision for Success targets. The team found that CHC has integrated development and assessment of Institution Set Standards into their ongoing planning practices. In addition, the College has established stretch goals and uses the Crafton Hills College Scorecard and Vision for Success targets -- in all twenty-two student and institutional outcomes -- to measure progress in its strategic directions. (I.B.3)

The IEAOC supports the assessment process across the College and provides guidance on how to use assessment that ties to improvement in supporting student learning. The team reviewed evidence, and discussed with College employees, how assessment data are tied to action plans to improve student outcomes. The SLO Cloud enhances the assessment process by recording results and generating reports that departments can use for planning purposes. Evidence from SLO Cloud and interviews show that CHC uses assessment data to supports student learning and student achievement. (I.B.4)

The College provides evidence of the relationship between planning, program review, and prioritization with documentation in various formats, including Research Briefs provided by the OIERP. Evidence included program review templates, plans in the web tool, analysis of student learning, progress on prior goals (math, theater arts, counseling, fiscal services) along with qualitative survey data and quantitative achievement data. The team found that CHC aligns the program review process to achieving the College mission, and programs use a variety of data, including assessment, achievement, and survey data. The College also conducts research related to the effectiveness of different program types and alternative learning strategies. Crafton Hills College assesses accomplishment of its mission through program review and evaluation of goals and objectives, student learning outcomes, and student achievement. (I.B.5)

The College disaggregates and analyzes learning outcomes and achievement for subpopulations of students in addition to course modality, section length, and specific course strategies. It also implements strategies in the case of identified performance gaps. Through the Academic Senate, Crafton Hills College adopted a plan to assess disaggregated learning outcomes and agreed to a six-year process aimed at addressing the teaching and learning process in terms of performance gaps in learning for certain student populations. CHC also addressed teaching methods, learning, and curriculum strategies in terms of their connection to performance gaps in learning for certain student populations. Evidence of responses to equity gaps and allocation of resources can be found in the College Student Equity Plan. The College has identified improvements in the assessment processes as a primary focus of its Quality Focus Essay. (I.B.6)

Crafton Hills College uses various means and evaluation tools to collect evidence about the effectiveness of its programs and services. Evidence of evaluation is found with the College's Planning and Program Review process (PPR) where program evaluation occurs along with evaluation of the process itself, which occurs annually. The PPRC surveys all program review participants to identify any areas of improvement. Evaluation through campus input is facilitated through the District Assembly, which uses an annual process to review policies. The College also evaluates employee perceptions through the Campus Climate Survey, and uses responses to the survey. The team found that CHC has systems in place to regularly evaluate practices and procedures. (I.B.7)

Crafton Hills College provides evidence of broad communication of all of its assessment and evaluation activities in ways that the institution has a shared understanding of its strengths and weaknesses and sets appropriate priorities. Data that are involved in the College's decision-making processes are provided to the community through Planning and Program Review processes on the Office of Institutional Effectiveness, Research, and Planning (OIERP) website. The OIERP is responsible for collecting such data and making them available for campus-wide participatory decision-making processes among the institution's constituents. The OIERP has also been involved in processes to make such data accessible in terms of faculty needs, including user-friendly dashboards. The College also provides public-level access to data on the OIERP website. Assessment data results of SLOs, ILOs, and SAOs are made available to the College community through emails, committee meetings and a newsletter. The OIERP website also includes a *Data Mart* page and BORG (Best Organizational Research Gauge) Data Cubes that



link to the San Bernardino Community College District (SBCCD) Executive Information System (EIS). The institution broadly communicates the results of all of its assessment and evaluation activities so that the institution has a shared understanding of its strengths and weaknesses and sets appropriate priorities. (I.B.8)

Crafton Hills illustrates that it engages in systematic evaluation and planning by referring to the College Planning and Program Review Committee (PPRC), which has developed a cyclical process central to integrated planning, evaluation, and resource allocation. CHC is further guided by its Comprehensive Master Plan: CHC's Educational Master Plan and Facilities Master Plan, aligned with the District Strategic Plan. To ensure broad participation, various governance committees participate in College planning:

- EMPC
- PPRC
- Budget Committee
- Institutional Effectiveness, Accreditation and Outcomes Committee
- Enrollment Strategies Committee
- Technology Planning Committee

CHC also disseminates all of its systematic evaluation and planning processes to all participatory governance groups at the institution. Additionally, the Office of Institutional Effectiveness, Research and Planning (OIERP) conducts campus-wide events for all interested parties that focus on planning efforts and processes. (I.B.9)

#### Conclusions:

The College meets the standard.

### **I.C. Institutional Integrity**

#### General Observations:

Crafton Hills College demonstrates that it provides clear and accurate information to students, the community, and other interested parties in both online and print publications. The College Catalog, available from the College website, includes policies affecting students, requirements for all CHC programs, and procedures important to students. Student policies and procedures are also described in the Online Orientation, the New Student Handbook, and the Schedule of Classes; these materials are reviewed by various entities on campus. The College's mission, vision, and values are displayed on the College website. The team also found that the website displays its ACCJC current accreditation status and all reports to the Commission.

Student success data are available through dashboards accessible online. The team confirmed that the College describes its degrees and certificates in a variety of locations available to students on the College website including the Catalog, the program website, and major sheets.

Policies, procedures, and College publications are reviewed regularly to assure that representation of its mission, programs, and services are accurate.

Information about the total cost of education is provided on the College website. Student standards of conduct that promote academic integrity, honesty, and responsibility are outlined in Board Policies that define academic dishonesty, various types of such misconduct, and the process for reporting violations. Board policies on academic freedom and responsibility requires that faculty protect students' rights to freedom of inquiry, and the evaluation process addresses this matter through the means by which faculty are evaluated.

### Findings and Evidence:

Crafton Hills College provides accurate and updated information about its educational programs, student support services to both its internal and external stakeholders. Information about its accreditation status with all its accreditors is available on the relevant webpages. The College assures the integrity of its mission, vision and values statements through an annual review process. Information on student achievement is publicly provided through the College's Fast Facts page and their Key Performance Indicators (KPIs) are available from the District's webpage (I.C.1).

The online catalog accurately presents all of the facts, requirements, policies and procedures of the College. The College provides a current online catalog, and as appropriate, College catalog amendments for students and prospective students. (I.C.2)

The College's Planning and Program Review Committee together with the Office of Institutional Effectiveness, Research and Planning (OIERP), support the program review and assessment processes. In order to assist all areas in their preparation of their program review, resources are provided on the College website with examples for each area to use. Additionally, a handbook on how to use the web tool and PPR timelines and schedules is posted on the CHC website. Research findings are published on the OIERP website along with data dashboards with information on student success and retention, full-time/part-time faculty ratio, efficiency, fill rates for courses, demographics by area, and the number of degrees and certificates awarded. The PPRC has developed a mentoring/coaching model that expands the College's capacity to support and evaluate these processes. The College lists its degree and certification completion rates prominently on the College's home page for current and prospective students. (I.C.3)

The College catalog lists all the degrees and certificates awarded organized by program offering. Program pages showcase clearly identified course requirements, expected learning outcomes, and course descriptions. (I.C.4)

The College administers an annual Committee Self-Evaluation Survey where members evaluate the effectiveness of their policies and processes to determine where improvements can be made. Discussion at participatory governance meetings may lead to changes in the Crafton Hills College Organizational Handbook. District board policies are reviewed and revised regularly and minutes detailing changes are posted to their website. (I.C.5)

The College catalog contains accurate information for current and prospective students regarding the cost of tuition, fees and other expenses. Students can easily link to the bookstore from the electronic schedule to determine additional materials costs. The College also lists zero-cost instructional material on the Admissions & Records website. For CTE classes, there is a Gainful Employment webpage which lists in further detail the additional cost of materials specific to those disciplines. (I.C.6).

The District's Board Policy 4030 on Academic Freedom demonstrates that the College actively commits to the free pursuit and dissemination of knowledge for all constituencies. The policy was updated on December 11, 2014. The academic freedom policy is also published in the catalog. The Faculty Handbook states that instructors have an "obligation to protect the student's right to freedom of inquiry even when the student's conclusions differ from those of the instructor". (I.C.7)

BP/AP 3050, Institutional Code of Ethics, directs employees of the District to conduct "business with honesty, integrity, professionalism, and quality in the performance of those operations and functions necessary to achieve its established mission and philosophy". Board Policy/Administrative Policy 5500, Standards of Student Conduct, establishes clear policies and procedures applying to student behavior and academic honesty. The College's Student Integrity Policy can also be found in the College's catalog and 2020 Student Handbook. (I.C.8)

Board Policy 4030 references the distinction between personal conviction and professionally accepted views of faculty. Students also evaluate instructors on the level of objectivity in the classroom through the Student Evaluation of Instructional Faculty Form. (I.C.9)

Standards I.C.10 and I.C.11 do not apply to Crafton Hills College (I.C.10, I.C.11).

Board Policy (BP) and Administrative Procedure (AP) 3200 describe the College's commitment to complying with accreditation eligibility requirements. Required annual and midterm ACCJC reports are posted on the College Accreditation webpage. Further, the College provides evidence that it met all of the progress report deadlines during its follow-up period in 2016 and offers the ACCJC timely submissions concerning substantive changes. The College also demonstrates its commitment to transparency by publishing all its correspondences with the Commission on its website. (I.C.12)

The team found evidence from the College website and catalog of communications with and information relating to external accrediting agencies. Communications between the Commission and the College are posted on the College website, and the College indicates its accreditation status on its home page. The College also maintains program accreditation or licensure for seven different Career/Technical Education (CTE) programs, which are identified in the College Catalog. CHC maintains clear and accurate communications with external accrediting/licensing agencies, and it clearly communicates its current accreditation status to the students and public. (I.C.13)

The team found Board Policy 2710 and its corresponding Administrative Procedure, which outline the responsibilities of College employees and members of its District's governing board on matters relating to actual and potential financial conflicts. The College's priority is student achievement and they have no investors, parent organization, or external interests. (I.C.14)

Conclusions:

The College meets the standard.

## Standard II

### Student Learning Programs and Support Services

#### II.A. Instructional Programs

##### General Observations

Overall, the College demonstrates commitment to reflect on, and address, ongoing needs in its instructional programs through a monitored improvement process.

The College is focused on improvements to their Program Review process (PPR), providing tools and newly placed coaches to enhance the quality of programs' self-assessment cycle. There is enthusiasm and intentional design around strengthening the Program Review process in an evidence-based supported manner through the College's PPR Committee.

The team was impressed with the overall quality and attention to Instructional Programs. Career and Technical programs are particularly reflective during the pandemic exploring flexible modalities out of necessity and measuring changes for positive impact on student learning. The programs are actively assessing the impact of instructional changes and using data to inform discussions internally and with external accreditors on the value of incorporating flexible instructional approaches into future program design.

##### Findings and Evidence

The program review process assures all course and program offerings, in all delivery modalities align with the Crafton Hills College mission and are appropriate for post-secondary education. Program descriptions in the College catalog and other published materials include student learning outcomes and a list of degrees and certificates that can be earned. The College reports against its Educational Master Plan metrics annually to examine outcomes year over year and lead conversations which further inform actions and planning to close disparate gaps. (II.A.1)

Faculty are involved in curriculum development and review to ensure course content is up to date and aligned with the College mission. The comprehensive program review process includes reflection on program content and effectiveness of instruction and outcomes to benefit student learning and achievement. Program review criteria includes analysis and engagement on relevancy, achievement of learning outcomes, and plans for the future. The program review process is consistently followed for instructional programs. (II.A.2)

In Career and Technical Education (CTE) programs, the review of curriculum and methods of instruction has become a program necessity, not just in the context of the COVID-19 pandemic, but due to natural disasters as recurring disruptions to instruction. Several CTE programs held robust self-assessment conversations with their departments and external accreditors to explore effective modes of delivery in addition to the very traditional face-to-face delivery. By examining alternative instructional delivery modes that met standards of relevancy, appropriateness, achievement of learning outcomes, and requirements of external accreditors,

programs such as Emergency Medical Services, Paramedic, and Respiratory Care have been able to adapt content and the teaching and learning environment and new designs of delivery for the betterment of student learning. The Team was impressed with the grounded approach to CTE assessment of student learning outcomes as a function of program and industry exam processes and results analysis. (II.A.2)

The College's process for program review, completed on a four-year cycle, is thorough with attention on continuous improvement. Within instructional divisions, not all departments complete program review on the same cycle. The College's process alternates the comprehensive program review, student learning outcomes assessment, and two-year Annual Plans from each other in a way that functions well for the College. Annually, programs update course outcome assessment results, and every second year the program updates course outcomes, goals, and objectives. Student attainment of learning outcomes are identified by program faculty as well as attainment of a degree or certificate leading to employment or transfer to other higher education programs. (II.A.2)

The College follows an established process to identify and regularly assess student learning outcomes for courses, programs, certificates, and degrees. Student learning outcomes are in place and faculty regularly assess these outcomes in courses, by program, and at the institutional level. Approved course outlines and syllabi include student learning outcomes. When a course is taught via distance education, the same student learning outcomes are listed. The College demonstrates there are verification practices in place to assure all students receive a course syllabus that include outcomes from the course outline of record. (II.A.3)

Crafton Hills College has developed procedures related to the creation, assessment, and improvement of courses, programs, certificates and degrees using student learning outcomes. Crafton Hills College has developed student learning outcomes for all courses, programs, and degrees and certificates as well as institutional learning outcomes (ILOs) for six overarching areas. Faculty in instructional areas are responsible for determining the student learning outcomes and assessment strategies. Documents and interviews confirm sustained and effective conversations take place across the College on student learning outcomes, assessment, and resulting course adaptations and improvements. (II.A.3)

Crafton Hills College distinguishes pre-collegiate level curriculum from College-level curriculum and directly supports students in learning the knowledge and skills necessary to advance and succeed in College-level curriculum. The College has a process and criteria for determining the appropriate credit type (credit, noncredit, not for credit) and delivery mode. Basic skill and College-level curriculum is aligned to ensure clear pathways for students. The Crafton Hills College catalog includes descriptions of and course numbering protocols for lower division courses applicable to degrees, noncredit, community education, and developmental courses not degree-applicable. The College catalog clearly delineates whether a course is pre-collegiate or College-level. Additionally, the College uses placement procedures to help students select the courses that best suit their needs. (II.A.4)

Crafton Hills College's degrees and programs follow practices common to American higher education, including appropriate length, breadth, depth, rigor, course sequencing, time to completion, and synthesis of learning. The College has policies and procedures in place to define these practices. All Crafton Hills College associate degree programs include a general education

component and require associate degrees demonstrate the satisfactory completion (C or better) of a minimum of 60 semester units. The College relies on the advice of the academic senate and the Curriculum Committee to approve and periodically review all courses and programs in breadth, depth, rigor, sequencing, time to completion and synthesis of learning. All of the mentioned policies are codified in Board policies and the College Curriculum Handbook. (II.A.5)

Crafton Hills College schedules courses in a manner that allows students to complete certificate and degree programs within a period of time consistent with established expectations in higher education. The College uses a two-year timeframe for full-time students in terms of the expected completion of associate degree requirements. Each program is required to develop a scheduling matrix in program review to ensure that students can complete certificate and degree programs within a specified period. Counseling faculty are integral in terms of assisting students in developing meaningful education plans. Time to completion data is an element used in program review and institutional planning informing College efforts to improve completion rates. (II.A.6)

Crafton Hills College effectively uses intentional instructional delivery modes, teaching methodologies, and learning support services that reflect the diverse and changing needs of its students. Courses are offered in traditional face-to-face, distance education (DE), and hybrid modes and equitable learning support services are provided for students. The College identifies student equity populations and continuously evaluates student success by group to examine success rates in completion and persistence. Processes are in place to regularly evaluate the effectiveness of delivery modes, measure student satisfaction, and guide improvements for a diverse student body. The College uses data and outcomes to plan and improve delivery of instruction and programs. (II.A.7)

Established policy and procedures ensure the College's distance education programs and delivery meet expectations for providing equitable services and regular and substantive interaction. To ensure distance education effectiveness, Crafton Hills College adopted an approval process for courses which are taught through alternative modalities. The College is building capacity in online teaching mentors, through accessing @ONE training and investing in five additional faculty earning the full @ONE certification. The team was impressed with the efforts of the Educational Technology Committee, a subcommittee of the Academic Senate, in terms of establishing and maintaining separate distance education course review processes and providing extensive faculty training for online teaching. (II.A.7)

Crafton Hills College validates the effectiveness of department-wide course and/or program examinations, where used, including direct assessment of prior learning. Crafton Hills College students in currently approved course may apply for credit by examination. Processes detailing credit by examination are included in the College catalog and on its website. The creation of exams is under the purview of discipline faculty. A number of instructional programs use department-wide assessment tools or common exams in entry-level or prerequisite courses where there is more than a single class section offered. As well, some departments also use department-wide examinations for courses and/or programs to gauge student performance and learning. (II.A.8)

The College has clear structures in place to ensure consistent application of program and department pre-requisites. Using CurricuNet, C-ID/UC/CSU patterns, and related data, the

Curriculum Committee has processes in place that demonstrate the College meets this standard. (II.A.8)

Crafton Hills College awards course credit, degrees and certificates based on student attainment of learning outcomes. The College has established Institutional Learning Outcomes, General Education Outcomes, Program Level Outcomes, and Course Level Student Learning Outcomes to evaluate all programs leading to a degree or state approved certificate. The College demonstrates that passing grades in course exams and assignments link directly to student learning outcomes and course credit is awarded based on students' demonstration of achieving learning outcomes. The College awards credits consistent with policy. The achievement of stated programmatic learning outcomes is the basis for awarding degrees and certificates. The College has a policy in place to follow federal standards for clock-to credit-hour conversions in the awarding of credit, BP4020. Academic departments assess all courses on a six-year cycle and CTE courses on a two-year cycle to ensure courses fulfill the objective of meeting expected student learning outcomes. (II.A.9)

Crafton Hills College makes available to its students clearly stated transfer-of-credit policies in order to facilitate the transfer mobility of students without penalty. The College has approved policies and procedures to address the transfer of classes from and to other higher education organizations. The College relies on a number of sources in terms of communicating these policies: College University Transfer Center, Counseling Department, Admissions & Records Office, College website, and College catalog. (II.A.10)

The College uses various means to assure that courses accepted for transfer have student learning outcomes comparable to those of corresponding Crafton Hills College courses. Transfer coursework policies and procedures are regularly reviewed. Course descriptions in the catalog and other materials indicate if the College course is CSU and/or UC transferable. The College has articulation agreements with public and private higher education organizations. (II.A.10)

Crafton Hills College includes in all of its programs, student learning outcomes, appropriate to the program level, competencies in communication, information, quantitative, analytic inquiry, ethical reasoning, engaging diverse perspectives, and other program-specific learning outcomes. All programs offered at the College require a general education pattern that include clearly stated learning outcomes. Faculty in major General Education areas have developed one or more outcomes for their areas. The College has adopted a Diversity and Multiculturalism requirement. (II.A.11)

The College relies on the expertise of faculty to determine the appropriate content and methodology of courses included in the General Education course cluster. This body of general education courses fulfill a published College philosophy of competencies which reflect degree requirements. The College follows a faculty-developed rationale for general education that serves as the basis for which courses are included as general education. This rationale is published in the catalog. (II.A.12)

The District BP 4025 and AP 4025 stipulate the core general education competencies and foundations required for the College's degree programs. At Crafton Hills College, faculty hold primary responsibility in terms of determining the specific courses that are part of specific general education and degree patterns and pathways. (II.A.12)



All of the College's programs include focused areas of study on one area of inquiry or in an established interdisciplinary core. These focused areas include key theories and practices appropriate for the certificate or associate degree level. According to its review, Crafton Hills College offers 105 degree or certificate programs. All programs publish course lists that fulfill at least 18 semester units of focused areas of study. (II.A.13)

Graduates at Crafton Hills College that complete career-technical certificates and degrees demonstrate technical and professional competencies that meet employment standards and other applicable standards and preparation for external licensure and certification. CTE faculty engage industry representative to discuss employment trends and industry needs, revising curriculum as appropriate to meet evolving standards. The College website maintains current information of licensure and other external employment standards and opportunities related to career technical degrees and certificates. (II.A.14)

The College verifies and maintains currency across all of its career-technical disciplines. The College determines competency levels and measurable student learning outcomes for all career and technical education degrees and certificates based upon faculty expertise and involved industry representatives. Using multiple measures of SLO-aligned exams, demonstrations, and written assignments in courses, Crafton Hills College ensures that career and technical education students possess the requisite knowledge and skills required in their fields of study. (II.A.14)

At Crafton Hills College, when programs are eliminated or program requirements are significantly changed, the institution makes appropriate arrangements so that enrolled students may complete their education in a timely manner with a minimum of disruption. The District publishes BP 4020 and AP 4021 to address program discontinuance, including a process for enrolled students to complete their education in a timely manner with minimum of disruption. Over the last ten years, only one program was discontinued at Crafton Hills College. The College's detailed program discontinuance process document was created by the College's Academic Senate. (II.A.15)

Crafton Hills College regularly evaluates and improves the quality and currency of all instructional programs offered in the name of the institution, including collegiate, pre-collegiate, career-technical, and continuing and community education courses and programs, regardless of delivery mode or location. The College regularly evaluates all courses and programs through an on-going systematic review of their relevance, appropriateness, achievement of learning outcomes, currency, and future needs and plans. The processes used for such evaluation includes: planning and program review (PPR), student evaluations, and faculty review of course outlines of record (CORs) conducted by the Education Technology Committee (ETC) and the Curriculum Committee. (II.A.16)

The Office of Institutional Effectiveness, Research, and Planning (OIERP) plays a significant role in providing faculty with effectiveness measures to be used in the review of instructional programs. Individual faculty are also involved in continual evaluation of the quality and currency of all instructional programs through their involvement in SLO assessments in their courses. Review of instructional quality and currency takes places in a number of Crafton Hill College's shared governance groups, including Crafton Council, Academic Senate, PPR Committee, Education Technology Committee, and the Curriculum Committee. The results of program evaluation are used in institutional planning. The College has processes in place in which program changes and improvements have occurred as a result of program evaluations. (II.A.16)

## Conclusions

The College meets the standard.

### **II.B. Library and Learning Support Services**

#### General Observations:

Crafton Hills College (CHC) supports student learning and achievement by providing library and other learning support services to students and to personnel responsible for student learning and support. The Library offers both in-person and online resources. The Library has an extensive collection of print and electronic materials and provides learning support services including reference assistance, research instruction, public access computers, Chromebooks and hotspots for student use, study rooms and printing services. The College provides a Tutoring Center with two locations (the Learning Resource Center and the Stem Center) that provides high quality tutoring for almost all subjects, with access in-person and online. The team was inspired by the CIS/Computer Science and Multimedia Labs successful initiative to move their students to a virtual workstation environment last semester so students in those respective courses can access high-end software needed to complete their coursework.

The Team was impressed with the Tutoring Center's ability to use assessment data and show that students who use the center are statistically significantly and substantially more likely to successfully complete their courses than students in the same section who did not access the center.

The Team was pleased to learn about the Krasovec Simulation Center and its important contributions to the College's CTE programs and its future goals to participate in the College's program planning and review process (PPRP) and develop service area outcomes (SAO's). The Library participates in the PPRP, however CHC has noted that the library's SAO's and student learning outcomes (SLOs) require attention.

#### Findings and Evidence:

CHC supports student learning and achievement by providing library and other learning support services to students and to personnel responsible for student learning. Along with the Library, support services include the Tutorial Center, STEM Center, CIS/Computer Science/Multimedia Labs, and the Krasovec Simulation Center. Ongoing instruction for users of library and other learning support services was made evident during the Team's visit to the College. Services appear to be sufficient in quantity, currency, depth, and variety to support educational programs, regardless of location or means of delivery, including distance education.

The Library recently started providing Chromebooks and hot spots for students during the COVID pandemic. The College's library staff works with faculty to ensure the availability of

discipline-related materials in the Library's collections. Faculty also provide Library staff with course syllabi and information that will help guide the Library selection processes. Tutoring for science, technology, engineering and mathematics (STEM) subjects is facilitated through the STEM Center, which also has computers for student use. The Tutoring Center provides a broad range of academic support services including subject and writing tutoring, study rooms, workshops and computers and printers. The Stanley Krasovec Simulation Center is used by allied health programs, the on-campus Day-Care Center serves as an interactive laboratory for early education students and fire academy/technology students have access to a fire engine garage, drill yard, and spray wall. (II.B.1.)

Relying on appropriate expertise, CHC selects and maintains educational equipment and materials to support student learning and enhance the achievement of the mission. Analysis of the Library collection is conducted on an on-going basis and this process is carried out in line with the collection development policy. The Tutoring Center, with locations in the Learning Resource Center and the STEM Center, works with instructional faculty to provide students with the support necessary to succeed in their classes, including computers and selected software programs. The College Technology Services department provides and maintains educational equipment and materials for the Library, the Tutoring Center, and classrooms. (II.B.2)

The Tutorial Center and STEM Center regularly evaluate their respective service area outcomes and use the results as a basis for improvement. The CIS/Computer Science/Multimedia labs are evaluated by faculty and media technicians and their assessments are tied to the courses that utilize the labs. PPRs do not appear to be done uniformly between some departments at the College. For example, the library currently has no meaningful SAOs or SLOs; however, the library is working with the new PPR Committee Coaching Program to develop and assess their SAO's and SLO's in order to meet identified student needs. The Krasovec Simulation Center has not developed SAOs or SLOs, and is determining whether their PPR process should be completed independently or as part of the larger CTE programs. (II.B.3)

The library and other learning support services document their substantive formal agreements. The contracts assure the security, maintenance and reliability of services and are regularly evaluated for their effectiveness within each of the support areas. (II.B.4)

#### Conclusions:

The College meets the Standard.

#### Recommendations for Improvement

##### Recommendation 1

In order to improve institutional effectiveness, the team recommends the College ensures that the Program Planning Review process is implemented consistently across all of the learning support and student support service areas. (II.B.3, II.C.2)

## **II.C. Student Support Services**

### General Observations:

Crafton Hills College (CHC) evaluates the quality of various student support services to demonstrate that they support student learning and enhance the accomplishment of the institution's mission. The College uses its Program Planning and Review (PPR) process to review student services offerings to ensure quality and the meeting of student needs. The Student Services programs at CHC are comprehensive in nature. The College provides counseling and/or academic advising programs to support student development and success and prepares faculty and other personnel responsible for advising functions. A wide variety of methods are used to orient students to ensure they understand the requirements related to their programs of study and receive timely, useful, and accurate information about relevant academic requirements, including graduation and transfer policies. The College regularly evaluates admissions and placement instruments and maintains student records according to industry standards. Co-curricular and athletics programs are suited to College's mission and contribute to the social and cultural dimensions of the educational experience of its students.

The team was impressed with several aspects of the College's student support services. For example, Counseling significantly improved their services based on assessment, feedback and continuous improvement. The team found that College's mental health services were exceptional. Program initiatives at the Transfer Center were also noteworthy and the Transfer Course Sandbox is an exemplary College completion tool. Further, the team was impressed by the Technology Success Center's proactive development of faculty modules on Universal Design for Learning and the individual assistance given to Disabled Students Programs and Services (DSPS) students in a remote environment in response to the COVID pandemic. Finally, the team applauds the College's actions to use real-time point of service assessments to quickly adapt changes to improve those services in the face of the COVID.

The team noted that while there are areas that could be strengthened that there is a strong commitment to qualitative assessment of their students for the purpose of program and service improvement. Examples include questions on exit surveys, satisfaction surveys and the Community College Student Survey of Engagement. The team learned that the College's assessment management tool, the SLO Cloud did not initially serve the needs of student support services and SAOs and this is being rectified. Based on the evidence and the interviews, it is clear to the team that the College recognizes its need to strengthen the program evaluation process.

### Findings and Evidence:

The team verified that CHC provides a wide array of student support services, regardless of location or means of delivery, including distance education, to support student learning. The College regularly evaluates the quality of student support services through the planning and program review process to enhance accomplishment of the institution's mission. CHC has identified robust plans for strengthening their assessment of service area and student learning outcomes. (II.C.1)

The team noted that the College's PPR process is well defined with respect to identifying and assessing learning support outcomes for its student population. This information informs the College's activities to provide appropriate student support services and programs to achieve those outcomes. The PPR processes facilitates the use of assessment data to continuously improve student support programs and services. PPRs do not appear to be completed consistently across departments. For example, newly established departments or those that have experienced significant leadership transition are still developing SAOs and working towards engaging in the PPR process. Additionally, some PPRs do not include SAO/SLO assessments and do not always make clear connections between findings and making improvements. (II.C.2)

The team found that CHC provides equitable access to appropriate comprehensive services through a combination of in-person and online support for students regardless of service location or delivery method. The team verified 17 support programs and each service is available via face-to-face or by telephone, email or web-based modalities. The College provides WebAdvisor so that students can register and pay for classes online, Cranium Café so that students can receive online synchronous counseling appointments as well as Starfish for online degree planning as just a few examples of the ways that students experience equitable access to student support services. (II.C.3)

The team reviewed evidence that CHC provides co-curricular and athletic programs that support its mission and contribute to the educational experience of its students. Co-curricular programs and athletics programs are suited to CHC's mission and contribute to the social and cultural dimensions of the educational experience of its students. CHC emphasizes that learning also takes place outside of the classroom setting. Co-curricular programs provide students with leadership opportunities and promote their social, cultural, and personal development. Although the team noted the Colleges plans for improvement in this area, the team learned through interviews with multiple constituent groups at CHC about the wide-variety of mental health services being utilized to support and enhance student success and found them to be laudable. (II.C.4)

The team noted that the College provides counseling, group advising, student education planning, and courses to support student development and success as well as prepares faculty and other personnel responsible for the advising function. Students can access counseling via in-person scheduled appointments, drop-in/walk-in sessions as well as online sessions. Counseling and advising programs at CHC orient students to ensure they understand the requirements related to their programs of study and receive timely, useful, and accurate information about relevant academic requirements, including graduation and transfer policies. A wide variety of methods are used to achieve this goal including print information, web information, workshops and in person or distance methods. The University Transfer Center, the Career Center and other specialized services are also available to students to assist them in meeting their completion goals. The team applauds the efforts and the outcomes of the University Transfer Center in and its use of Canvas and Starfish nudges to increase the number of students who complete their degree requirements and as a result transfer at more than twice the average rate of other Colleges in the Inland Empire or that of the entire California Community College system.

To ensure counseling faculty provide accurate and up to date information about academic policies, regulations, requirements and best practices, CHC also encourages student services faculty and staff to attend professional conferences and regular Inservice trainings are implemented at departmental meetings. (II.C.5)

Crafton Hills College adopted and adheres to admission policies consistent with its mission and follows BP 5010 Admissions Concurrent Enrollment that specifies students' eligibility for admission. BP 5010, which relates to both admissions and residency requirements, establishes these policies. The College provides educational opportunities to students from diverse economic, cultural, and educational backgrounds. The team verified that information and requirements about pathways to complete degrees, certificate and transfer goals are published in the catalog and on the website. The College also outlines the process for Special Admissions students including Dual Enrollment and International Students. (II.C.6)

The College regularly evaluates admissions and placement instruments and practices to validate their effectiveness while minimizing biases. The team confirmed that the College utilizes the state's CCCApply portal for its admissions instrument. CHC has implemented requirements of Assembly Bill 705 as they relate to admissions and placement. The team noted that CHC, in adherence with AB705, uses a combination of a placement questionnaire and high school academic performance in a multiple measures of assessment process. Also, the College has initiated a method for regular review and updating changes to the process for continuous evaluation and improvement. (II.C.7)

The College maintains student records permanently, securely, and confidentially, with provision for secure backup of all files, regardless of the form in which those files are maintained. CHC publishes and follows the established Board Policy and Administrative Procedure 3310 Retention and Destruction of Records. Additionally, the team confirmed that the College Catalog and Student Handbook include the guidelines for the Family Educational Rights and Privacy Act (FERPA), describing the policies that ensure the confidentiality of student records and personal information. Regular staff trainings also ensure compliance with FERPA regulations. Stipulations related to employee level of access to student records—determined upon hire—are further used to guarantee the security of student records at the College. (II.C.8).

#### Conclusions:

The College meets the standard.

#### Recommendations for Improvement:

See Recommendation 1

## Standard III

### Resources

#### III.A. Human Resources

##### General Observations:

Crafton Hills College has policies and procedures that ensure that all employees meet standard qualifications and that clearly outline the process for hiring faculty, staff, and management employees per Board Policy and Administrative Procedure 7120 – this includes regular evaluation, orientation and oversight.

Each of the Board Policies and Administrative Procedures are available to the public on the website. All open positions are posted on the website with links to both the applications and corresponding job descriptions. Job descriptions provide the details related to the position duties, responsibilities, minimum qualifications, and/or preferred qualifications, if there are any. For full-time faculty, qualifications and hiring processes include knowledge of the discipline and the requisite skills to perform the position adequately.

##### Findings and Evidence:

The College and the District adheres to hiring regulations, procedures and protocols in order to ensure they meet the needs of a diverse student body, and provide support in student learning programs, services, success and improve institutional effectiveness – these includes Administrative Procedures 7210, 7230, 7240, 7250, and 7260. The College’s employment practices are overseen by the District’s Office of Human resources.

The team reviewed the function map, which outlined the joint, primary, and secondary responsibilities that the San Bernardino Community College District and Crafton Hills College share in ensuring the quality of their programs and services by employing administrators, faculty and staff who are for qualified based upon appropriate education, training, and experience.

Additionally, the team noted that College adheres to the criteria in the minimum qualifications for faculty and administrators in California Community Colleges; the College’s AP 7211 Faculty service areas minimum qualifications and equivalencies, which provide an opportunity for a faculty and/or an administrator lacking the qualifications for particular positions to apply for an equivalency using the District’s request for equivalency form along with appropriate supporting documentation. (III.A.1)

Hiring processes ensure that faculty possess the appropriate degrees, professional experience, discipline expertise, level of assignment, teaching skills, scholarly activities, and candidates’ potential to contribute to the mission and goals of Crafton Hills College and San Bernardino Community College District (SBCCD). AP 7120 and 7210 outlines how the College hires faculty who meet the minimum qualifications and possess the necessary skills to help ensure the College

hires faculty who meet the minimum qualifications and possess the necessary skills to help the College meet its mission. (III.A.2)

Qualifications of administrators are addressed using Minimum Qualifications in Administrative Procedures 7210, 7250, and 7260. Administrators and other College personnel responsible for educational programs and services undergo similar recruitment and overall screening for appropriate qualifications and experience as faculty. All successful candidates must submit official transcription to the Office of Human Resources upon hiring. (III.A.3)

The team noted that the College collaborates with the District Office of Human Resource on its verification of academic degrees from U.S. and international universities. Administrative Procedure 7211 outlines requirements concerning accredited institutions. The District ensures that all hiring processes are readily available including establishing equivalencies foreign degrees from appropriately accredited institutions by approved third-party agencies. (III.A.4)

The College ensures timely evaluation of its personnel adhering to performance evaluation criteria utilizing processes that the team verified have been negotiated via the collective bargaining requirements and outlined in the CTA contract for faculty and the CESA contract for classifies staff. For managers, Administrative Procedure 7150 establishes the method for evaluating managers for their effectiveness in performing their duties. Should any employee be determined to have deficiencies, there are performance improvement strategies and documents available for supervisors to use. (III.A.5)

Standard III.A.6 is no longer applicable.

The College regularly reviews data on faculty numbers to determine sufficiency. Prioritization of faculty hiring is conducted through the Planning and Program Review Process. The College's planning and program review process helps to determine and assess the need for additional full-time faculty. The District continually evaluates services, programs and departments to ensure sufficient staffing. (III.A.7)

The Team noted that the College engages in a number of activities to ensure that part-time faculty are integrated into the life of the institution. In addition to an orientation session at the beginning of each semester that welcomes part-time faculty, they are also provided with professional development and invited to participate in division and department meetings and activities. The Academic Senate provides for up to four part-time faculty to be elected as senators; likewise, a part-time faculty member is selected to serve on the District CTA board.

Further part-time faculty are invited to an orientation and are included in the Academic Senate. They receive compensation for professional development and are evaluated regularly as described in the CTA-District Agreement. (III.A.8)

The College's Planning and Program Review process helps to assess the need for new positions or determine the outcome for positions that may become vacant through retirement or resignations. Each area completes a comprehensive Planning and Program Review to identify whether there are sufficient staff to support effective educational, technical, physical and



administrative operations of the College and makes requests for additional resources as needed. (III.A.9)

The team verified that institution has developed Board Policy and Administrative Procedures which govern the processes to determine the appropriate number, qualifications, and organization of administrators. The College maintains a sufficient quantity of qualified administrators who ensure effective leadership in support of its mission. Like other positions at the institution, administrative roles go through the Planning and Program Review process for prioritization. (III.A.10)

The team observed board policies, administrative procedures, and collective-bargaining agreements/contracts are readily available on the District website for review. Human Resources, the Academic Senate and the appropriate collective bargaining unit regularly review policies and procedures related to personnel and their employment. Written personnel policies are available on the Human Resources website. Lighthouse Services is used to provide a venue for concerns about fair and equitable administration of policies. (III.A.11)

The College emphasizes the importance of supporting diversity in its mission statement and in Board Policies and Administrative Procedures. The District demonstrated commitment to providing equitable opportunities in BP 3410 regarding non-discrimination and its 2017-20 Equal Employment Opportunity (EEO) Plan. It was noted that EEO training is offered. Further, Human Resources collects, reviews and engages in detailed data analysis to determine if there is significant under representation of a monitored group.

The team examined the College's educational master plan internal and external demographic scan data, which included the number and percent of employees by position, gender, and ethnicity as a means of demonstrating the value of equity and inclusiveness. Employee demographic data is gathered annually. The team learned through interviews that a high priority is placed on professional development that will support the College's ability to advance equity, which has included CHC's participation in the inaugural California Community College Equity Leadership Alliance where representatives from the College have already had an opportunity to come back to campus and share their learnings from the implicit bias e-convening with USC Race and Equity Center with a goal of informing CHC hiring practices. (III.A.12)

The team noted that AP 3050 The Institutional Code of Ethics outlines the Districts recognition of its responsibility and obligation to the public and to the students it serves to conduct business with honesty, integrity, professionalism, quality in the performance of those operations and functions necessary to achieve its mission as described in the policy. This AP is applicable to all District employees. Each employee constituency group, The Academic Senate, Managers, Classified Senate, and the Board of Trustees, all have a statement referencing ethics as well as the expectation of ethical behavior and consequences for failure to adhere. These statements are available on the College website. Likewise, BP 2715 Code of Ethics for the Board of Trustees is both online and contained in the Trustee Handbook. (III.A.13)

In alignment with its mission and its Comprehensive Master Plan, the College provides employees with a wide-variety of opportunities for continued professional development. The

team observed that professional development is also referenced in the Mission Statement. Additionally, the team reviewed the College's professional development website that outlines opportunities offered both by the professional development committee (PDC) and the District FLEX program as well as those the professional development coordinator has recommended. During interviews and a review of evidence, the team learned that the PDC facilitated focus groups this fall semester to identify additional professional development needs and has administered surveys to assess the effectiveness of and satisfaction with the professional development activities offered at CHC. (III.A.14)

Maintaining the security and confidentiality of personnel records is a District primary responsibility. The institution has provisions for keeping personnel records secure and confidential. In compliance with AP 7145, the District assures the safety and privacy of personnel records while providing employees with an opportunity to access their personnel files upon request. The compliance hotline hosted by Lighthouse Services provides a method for filing complaints either by telephone or online. (III.A.15)

Conclusions:

The College meets the Standard.

### **III.B. Physical Resources**

General Observations:

Crafton Hills College (CHC) assures a safe and sufficient physical resource at its campus. Crafton Hills College maintains the operations and safety of its campus and shares the responsibility with the District office for planning and construction. Crafton Hills College has a very robust physical resource. It's planning, procedures and transparency is outstanding. Crafton Hills College has a very thorough safety plan and collaborates with the District in maintaining written safety procedures.

Findings and Evidence:

The team reviewed the Illness and Prevention program, the Hazardous Waste Management Plan, the Emergency Operations Plan, the Facilities Program Review Plan, the deferred maintenance plan, the Safety Committee minutes, and other evidence provided by Crafton Hills College. The College provided ample evidence that it assures a safe, secure, healthful learning and support environment. (III.B.1)

The team reviewed the evidence provided by Crafton Hills College such as the total cost of ownership for equipment and tools, and the Master Plan and Facilities Master Plan prioritizing projects based upon educational needs and occupant safety. The College outlined the various projects supported with bond money to create new building and address immediate needs of the campus. The team noted that CHC clearly demonstrates its plans to acquire, build, maintain, and

upgrade physical resources including facilities and equipment necessary to supports its programs and services and achieve its mission. (III.B.2)

Crafton Hills College provided as evidence a report of a facilities assessment. The team observed that the report summarizes the condition of each facility using a scoring system called the Facility Condition Index. This information is used to evaluate and plan the extent of each renovation and what buildings should be considered for demolition and replacement. This report is in addition to the Facilities Master Plan. The evidence provided to the team clearly demonstrate that Craft Hills College evaluate its facilities and equipment on a regular basis. (III.B.3)

The team verified through evidence provided by Crafton Hills College such as the Comprehensive Master Facilities Plan, which itemized projects to be completed in the next seven years that the College has long range capital plans that support institutional improvement goals and reflect projection of the total cost of ownership of new facilities and equipment. (III.B.4)

#### Conclusions:

The College meets the Standard.

### **III.C. Technology Resources**

#### General Observations:

Crafton Hills College provides technology services, professional support, facilities, hardware, and software appropriate and adequate to support the College's management and operational functions, academic programs, teaching and learning, and support services. The institution continuously plans for, updates and replaces technology to ensure its technological infrastructure, quality and capacity are adequate to support its mission, operations, programs, and services. Crafton Hills College assures that technology resources at all locations where it offers courses, programs, and services are implemented and maintained to assure reliable access, safety, and security.

The institution provides appropriate instruction and support for faculty, staff, students, and administrators, in the effective use of technology and technology systems related to its programs, services, and institutional operations and it has policies and procedures that guide the appropriate use of technology in the teaching and learning processes. As evidenced in conversations with District and campus technology staff, the Team applauds SBCCD and Crafton Hills College for proactively responding to technology staffing, training and support, and marketing efforts as related to District and College surveys. The Team also recognizes SBCCD and Crafton Hills College for organizational initiatives connected to District-College facilitation of technology needs as well as those involving committees connected to technology and educational technology.

### Findings and Evidence:

At Crafton Hills College, technology services, professional support, facilities, hardware, and software are appropriate and adequate to support the College's management and operational functions, academic programs, teaching and learning, and support services. Technology resources are under the purview of Crafton Hills College Technology Services and the San Bernardino Community College District office of Technology and Educational Support Services (TESS). Assistance for assistive technology, audiovisual service, and instructional design requests are handled by the College Technology Services department. The SBCCD Helpdesk provides a procedure through which employees may request technology support. The College Technology Services department oversees campus technology and electronics infrastructure. SBCCC and Crafton Hills College, through committees (Technology Planning Committee, Educational Technology Committee, DAWG, DECC), policies and plans (District Technology Strategic Plan, CHC Technology Plan, Operations Manual), and feedback (including climate and technology surveys), assures that appropriate and adequate technology are made available to students and staff. (III.C.1)

Crafton Hills College continuously plans for, updates, and replaces technology to ensure its technological infrastructure, quality, and capacity are adequate to support its mission, operations, programs, and services. The District addresses technology needs at the initial level of institutional planning. The Technology Services department participates in the annual planning and program review (PPR) that includes a resource allocation process for unit-level objectives that are prioritized at a College-wide level. The list of priorities guides the College's allocation of technological resources. The Technology Services department has stated, and has begun to act on, goals related to the hiring of additional technology services staff. The annual planning and program review (PPR) also allows for all other units to develop their own specific goals related to technology and, based on the PPR process, such requests may be funded by the College. All technology requests that are provided through the PPR process are detailed on the PPR Committee's webpage. (III.C.2)

In terms of technology updates, the College stresses the alignment of the Technology Plan and the Comprehensive Master Plan. Currently, only three instructional spaces are without installed smart technology. Classrooms also have Wi-Fi and Bluetooth capabilities to assure appropriate and adequate student learning. To maintain and expand the College's technology, Technology Services receives approximately \$400,000 per year to replace outdated computers on a five-year rotation. It uses an asset list by location to ensure equipment is inventoried, tracked, and replaced regularly. Technology Services also works with a number of campus entities (Technology Planning Committee, Educational Technology Committee, District Technology and Educational Services, and the District Applications Workgroup) to ensure that College technology needs are adequate. (III.C.2)

The Technology Planning Committee has developed multi-year educational technology plans that align with the College's Comprehensive Master Plan and the SBCCD Strategic Plan and that include a number of College/District benchmarks. In terms of educational technology, the College's Educational Technology Committee has oversight of in-person and DE class technology. Additionally, it developed a 2016-2020 Distance Education Plan that addresses the

College's goals and needs in Distance Education. It also includes benchmarks and stipulations in terms of College support for the Canvas LMS, faculty training, and support for online students. Crafton Hills College has approved a Technology Plan and it also operates using an Operations Manual that includes the identification of minimum technology standards for classrooms and other learning environments. (III.C.2)

Crafton Hills College assures that technology resources at all locations where it offers courses, programs, and services are implemented and maintained to assure reliable access, safety, and security. The College Technology Services department is responsible for assisting employees in the setup, maintaining, and repairing of College equipment and technology. It is also has oversight for ensuring the College's compliance with State and federal disabilities and privacy laws and for assisting employee users with questions about equipment and technology use. The College offers courses through its dual-enrollment partnerships at high schools. In such cases, classroom technology is under the purview of those associated school Districts. The College, through the SBCCD Strategic Plan, has identified an emergency plan that addresses the reliability of District and College technology resources. The District and College test backup Web services to assure continual operations of all technology services. (III.C.3)

Crafton Hills College provides appropriate instruction and support for faculty, staff, students, and administrators, in the effective use of technology and technology systems related to its programs, services, and institutional operations. The District and College share responsibility in terms of meeting technological instruction needs. The Technology Planning Committee develops and oversees a comprehensive technology plan for the College, identifies and troubleshoots technology issues at a strategic level, and evaluates technology opportunities at the College. (III.C.4)

CHC's Professional Development Committee provides opportunities for staff training in areas that include technology. The College's Educational Technology Committee offers opportunities for faculty to develop DE teaching skills. Crafton Hills College also offers technology training in areas that enhance College operations; for example, eLumen, Starfish, and WebAdvisor. The College relies on surveys to determine if faculty, staff, and students are satisfied with current technology on campus. SBCC and Crafton Hills College have increased the marketing of technology to staff to provide for better understanding of the possible uses and applications of technology in offices and learning settings. (III.C.4)

San Bernardino Community College District and Crafton Hills College have policies and procedures that guide the appropriate use of technology in the teaching and learning processes. BP and AP 3720 detail employees' responsibilities when using District technology, such as computers, while BP and AP 3920 focus on the proper use of employee email. The College's Technology and Educational Services (TESS) department has primary oversight of key areas of technology including printing, distance education technology, and District computing services. It also provides support for classroom technology implementation. The District maintains a District Technology Strategic Plan and provides an Operations Manual that details minimum standards of technology for classroom and learning environments. (III.C.5)

Conclusions:

The College meets the standard.

### **III.D. Financial Resources**

General Observations:

As of the two Colleges in multi-District, Crafton Hills College (CHC) is supported by San Bernardino Community College District (SBCCD) to ensure Crafton Hills College has sufficient resources to sustain its instructional and student support services. San Bernardino Community College District has sufficient general fund reserves to support Crafton Hills College until the College can increase enrollment and obtain additional resources through growth, projected in the fiscal year 2023/2024. San Bernardino Community College District is in the process of revising the resource allocation model utilizing the new Student Center Funding Formula to allow for more resources to be allocated to a small College. CHC continues to increase instructional course offerings and respond to student demands. With the added resources Crafton Hills College has sufficient capacity to support and sustain its instructional and student programs and does continue to improve upon them. Financial and institutional planning are integrated from the department-level to the District-level through the annual program review process and the resource allocation process.

Findings and Evidence:

The team concluded that with the additional resources provided by San Bernardino Community College District reserves, as provided by the evidence such as the SBCCD budget for 2019/2020 and the projected multiyear budget forecast, ensure that the financial resources are sufficient to support and sustain student learning programs and services, and improve institutional effectiveness. (III.D.1)

The team reviewed the 2019-2020 Planning & Program Review Handbook, the prioritized directives for the 2020-2021 General Fund Budget, looked at the various committee's websites and minutes as provide by Crafton Hills College and concluded that the institution has policies and procedures to ensure sound financial practices and fiscal stability. The financial information is clearly disseminated throughout the institution. Through the program planning the team concluded that the institution's mission and goals are the foundation for financial planning, and it is integrated and supports institutional planning. (III.D.2)

The team reviewed the applicable board policies, the flow chart on the budget development process including instructions, and Council minutes. The team verified through interviews and evidence that the institution clearly defines and follows its guidelines and processes for financial planning and budget development, with all constituencies having appropriate opportunities to participate in the planning and budget development. (III.D.3)

The team received and reviewed an updated draft of the Resource Allocation Model. San Bernardino Community College District is continually reassessing the funds being allocated to Crafton Hills College. The team also reviewed the Resource Allocation Model for

2019/2020 and the proposed allotment of the Federal Communications Commission proceeds. The team concluded that the institutional planning reflects a realistic assessment of financial resource availability and exceptional development of additional financial resources. (III.D.4)

The team reviewed the annual financial report for fiscal year 2018/2019 and noticed findings from the external auditors. The team was advised that San Bernardino Community College implemented a new enterprise software when going for fiscal independence and that the District had some implementation challenges in the first year. 2019/2020 was their first year of being fiscally independent and the second year on the new enterprise system. Through discussion with the various College administrators, the District was able to overcome the obstacles and have instituted new processes and procedures to ensure financial integrity and improve on internal control. The team found that upon discussions with Crafton Hills College and San Bernardino Community College District, and additional evidence provided, that the CHC has appropriate control mechanisms to ensure financial integrity. The College in conjunction with the District regularly evaluates its financial management practices and uses the results to improve internal control systems. (III.D.5).

Upon review of the self-evaluation and evidence of financial documents, including the budget, resource allocation model and multi-year budget forecast, the team concluded that the financial documents, including the budget, have a high degree of credibility and accuracy and reflect appropriate allocation and use of financial resources to support student learning programs and services. (III.D.6)

San Bernardino Community College District's financial statements had several audit findings. The financial statements clearly indicate the College's responses which addresses the issues involved. In discussion with the College, all findings from the external audit are communicated with the appropriate constituency groups, and they do not have any repeat findings. The team concluded that the institutional responses to the external audit findings are comprehensive, timely and communicated appropriately. (III.D.7)

The team reviewed San Bernardino Community College annual financial statements and held discussions with the various campus administrators for SBCCD, who fully explained how some of the internal controls are evaluated and assessed. For instance, the implementation of the new Questica budget program ensures cost center managers do not spend more than the allotted budget, that there are several layers of approvals and position control for monitoring positions. The College also explained that they had to demonstrate adequate internal procedures in order for the County to allow them to go fiscally accountable. Further, CHC had to run parallel systems for a year to demonstrate accuracy and integrity. The team concluded based upon details shared during the interview that the College in conjunction with San Bernardino Community College District not only evaluates and assesses internal controls for validity and effectiveness, but also the results are used for improvement. (III.D.8)

Crafton Hills College in conjunction with San Bernardino Community College District keep a general fund reserve above the required minimum of 5%. Board policy requires reserves to be between 10-15%. SBCCD also regularly monitors cash flow. Based upon the interviews and evidence, the team confirmed that CHC has sufficient cash flow and reserves to maintain

stability, to support strategies for appropriate risk management and to implement contingency plans that meet financial emergencies and unforeseen occurrences. (III.D.9)

District and College finances are managed by District Fiscal Services with collaboration and support of College Administrative Services. College revenues and expenses are managed through an enterprise system that enables the College to ensure that the funds are used appropriately. Based upon review of the evidence and interviews with the College, the team found the institution practices effective along with appropriate oversight of finances, including financial aid, grants, externally funded programs, contractual relationships, auxiliary organizations or foundations, and institutional investments and assets. (III.D.10)

San Bernardino Community College District in conjunction with Crafton Hills College sets aside and invests in funds dedicated for the payments of long-term debt and liabilities. They also include in their planning and budgeting payments for short term obligations. CHC in conjunction with SBCCD clearly identifies, plans, and allocates resources for payment of liabilities and future obligations. (III.D.11)

San Bernardino Community College District has set up an irrevocable trust to fund Other Post-Employment Benefits (OPEB) that is currently funded at 91%. They also had an actuarial study performed utilizing appropriate accounting standards, for GASB 74 and 75, which was included in the audited financial statements. SBCCD in conjunction with Crafton Hills College assesses and allocates funds for repayment of short term and long-term debt. (III.D.12) (III.D.13).

San Bernardino Community College District in conjunction with Crafton Hills College ensures all funds are used with integrity in a manner consistent with the intended purpose of the funding source. Board Policy and administrative procedures have been adopted to ensure effective oversight. External audits for the foundation and the bond funds are performed annually. (III.D.14)

Crafton Hills College has not issued student loans since 2011. In 2019, the District made the decision to resume being part of the loan program effective fall 2020. Thus, there is no current data for student loan default rates available. After meeting with Crafton Hills officials, the team concluded that there are appropriate procedures in place to ensure the institution monitors and will manage student default rates in compliance with Federal requirements. (III.D.15).

Crafton Hills College in conjunction with San Bernardino Community College District processes contractual agreements. Through board policy, administrative procedures, and board approval, the College's contractual agreements are consistent with their missions and goals. The board and administrative policies as well as the narrative demonstrate appropriate oversight at the District and College level to maintain the integrity and quality of its programs. (III.D.16)

Conclusions:

The College meets the standard.



## Standard IV

### Leadership and Governance

#### IV.A. Decision-Making Roles & Processes

##### General Observations:

Crafton Hills College relies on their committee structure to support governance and decision-making at the College. Committee roles and functions that facilitate governance are described in the College Organizational Handbook. Committees at Crafton Hills College are organized in four broad categories with the Crafton Council the central point of governance College-wide with all Senates (Classified Staff, Student, Faculty) represented, union representation, and administrative leadership. Crafton Hills College is pro-actively creating a repository of committee self-evaluations that is easy to access and provides data across years for transparency.

The collegial consultation roles described in the College Organizational Handbook and Board Policy 2510 encourage participation from faculty, students, and staff in student-centered decision-making. Faculty fulfill significant roles in areas of curriculum and College programs. Students are engaged to participate. The College President facilitates College-wide activities to invite diverse voices to speak to improving practices, programs and services.

##### Findings and Evidence:

The team reviewed BP and AP 2510 (Collegial Consultation) and the Crafton Hills College Organizational Handbook explaining the roles all constituencies fulfill in decision-making processes. Further, the College webpages provide information about how members of different constituencies participate in decision-making, inform employees on issues discussed and action taken at committee meetings. College committee records are published and available. (IV.A.1)

The Employee Campus Climate Survey provides evidence that the College evaluates their governance and other processes. The College has a robust structure that allows faculty, staff, students, and managers an opportunity to participate. The Crafton Council and its supporting committee structure strengthen effective planning and are engaged in relevant discussions. (IV.A.1)

The District's BP and AP 2510 and the College's Organizational Handbook provide the foundation for roles and responsibilities in decision making processes through their committee structure. The District Assembly is the primary District-wide body to ensure constituent group participation in the decision-making process, on which the Crafton Hills College President sits. Assembly members advise and make recommendations to the Chancellor regarding District-wide governance, institutional planning, budgeting, and policies and procedures that promote the educational mission and goals of the San Bernardino Community College District. (IV.A.2)

Crafton Council Committees have representation from staff, student, faculty, and administrative groups, and report to the Crafton Council. The Council Committees include students, and student voices are represented through Student Senate appointments. Evidence of student input was found in Student Senate Agendas where topics such as approving a first reading of the 2019-2020 Student Equity Plan, discussions of a bond measure, and other matters were discussed. (IV.A.2)

The Crafton Hills College Organizational Handbook define the roles for each constituent group in governance. The Crafton Council oversees the participatory governance process as described in the Organizational Handbook. This body represents all campus constituencies and includes the College President, Academic Senate President and Vice President, Classified Senate President, a CSEA representative, Associated Students President, VP of Student Services, VP of Instruction, and VP of Administrative Services. Crafton Hills College references Title 5 to define the role of faculty as they relate to academic and professional matters and describes opportunity for collegial consultation for faculty regarding day to day operations and long-range planning. The Planning and Program Review Handbook and the Integrated Planning and Program Review Process for Prioritizing Objectives describes the process by which all units on campus participate in institutional planning and the prioritization of resources. All groups have a clearly defined and broad ability to participate in decision-making at Crafton Hills College. (IV.A. 3)

The District's BP and AP 4020 (Program, Curriculum, and Course Development) state the faculty, through its academic senate, are involved in all program and curriculum processes. The BP and AP on Collegial Consultation (2510) states "...issues related to academic and professional matters the Board will rely primarily on the Academic Senate." (IV.A.4)

The Curriculum Committee is authorized by the Academic Senate to make recommendations to the Board of Trustees about the curriculum of the College, including approval of new courses and programs, deletion of existing courses and programs, proposed changes, review of course outlines, review of degree and certificate requirements, changes in degree and certificate requirements, and approval of prerequisites and co-requisites. Crafton Hills College Curriculum Handbook outlines the processes for carrying out functions related to curriculum and programs. (IV.A.4)

In addition to the Academic Senate's Curriculum Committee, evidence exists through function descriptions that other Academic Senate committees address issues on curriculum and student learning programs and services on campus. These include the Educational Policies Committee, the Honors Committee, and the Educational Technology Committee. Crafton Hills College faculty and academic administrators fulfill their roles in making recommendations about curriculum and student learning programs and services. (IV.A.4)

The College's shared governance process and structure affords broad-based participation in the governance process by all campus constituencies to ensure collegial decision-making processes. For example, interviews confirmed broad scale participation during writing of the ISER through committees and departments. (IV.A.5)

The Campus Climate Survey documents improvement in attitudes towards governance and collaboration. The College incorporates its decision-making structures into the development of College plans and planning, efforts which align with the Educational Master Plan, and the result of these efforts resulting in institutional improvement. (IV.A.5)

The College ensures the appropriate consideration of relevant perspectives, with recent increased professional development and College-wide activities to encourage more diverse voices and participation to maximize an inclusive campus environment and inform student-centered decision-making. (IV.A.5)

BP/AP 2510 identifies the District's intention to communicate its processes for decision-making and the outcomes of those processes. Decisions and explanations from committee discussions are communicated to the campus community by reports from collegial consultation committee members representing constituencies, committee meeting minutes posted on the College website under that committee, and -- for planning and program review actions -- through an annual letter from the College President. (IV.A.6)

The College regularly evaluates its governance and decision-making structures. The College annually administers a Campus Climate Survey with results of the survey shared College-wide in a report, Educational Master Plan metrics are published in a dashboard. Further evidence included broad communications, active webpages with committee updates, and presentations at committee meetings. (IV.A.7)

The team found that like with most aspects of governance at Crafton Hills College, the policies, procedures, and descriptions of intended outcomes are in place. In the College's own documents, participatory governance characteristics are defined by inclusiveness, rigorous dialogue, and collaborative decision-making. (IV.A.7)

The College lists their committee types with the central College Council overseeing functional, constituent, and ad hoc committees. The College Handbook and Board Policy 2510 describe participative roles for faculty, students, and staff in decision-making. The College demonstrates strong commitment and focus on participation and inclusiveness through decision-making roles and processes. (IV.A.7)

Through committee surveys and institutional climate surveys, the College is able to gather data for assessment on the effectiveness of their committees in reaching their goals as well as perceptions campus wide on efforts. The team confirmed in interviews that these survey results are utilized to make improvements on campus. (IV.A.7)

### Conclusions:

The College meets the standards

## **IV.B Chief Executive Officer**

The President of the College is the chief executive officer and has the full charge and control of the administration and business affairs of the College. The president is charged with the implementation of board policies of the Board of Trustees. District Board Policies and Administrative Procedures articulate the responsibilities of College President in most, if not all, areas that define the position of institutional chief executive officer.

The Board and chancellor delegate authority and responsibility for Crafton Hills College to the College president. The president has ensured an administrative structure to allow for effective leadership, management, and operations. The president engages in a system of structured meetings with administration, constituent groups, and participatory governance groups to allow for open discussion and broad participation in institutional planning and evaluation including emphasis on institutional effectiveness, budget, and accreditation.

The president delegate's operational decision-making to the vice presidents, deans, or other administrators over their respective areas as documented in the organizational chart. The organizational structure of the College is clearly delineated in the Crafton Hills College Organizational Handbook, which is updated annually with input from participatory governance committees and the academic, classified, and student senates. The president demonstrates a strong role in leadership, planning, budgeting, and selecting personnel, and institutional effectiveness.

There is evidence that the CEO guides institutional improvement and sets Institutional Set Standards (ISS) and follows the Comprehensive Master Plan and Program Review process to link resource allocation with program and strategic planning.

Under the direction of the President, the Office of Institutional Effectiveness, Research and Planning (OIERP) regularly examines research on student learning and provides this information with the campus community. Accreditation is prominent at Crafton Hills College and is supported by the CEO. In addition, the CEO is active in campus and District committees as well as community organizations.

During his first year, the president actively contributed to service organizations, professional groups, K-12 Districts, governance organizations, and provided leadership for the CHC Foundation.

### Findings and Evidence:

Board Policy and Administrative Procedures support the reporting structure of the president to the District. Direct leadership occurs predominantly within the Chancellor's Cabinet, through multiple participatory governance committees, institutional planning documentation and process. (IV.B.1)

The president demonstrates responsibility in budgeting, planning, selecting personnel, and assessment of institutional effectiveness. The president uses CHC's Comprehensive Master Plan,

which combines the Educational and Facilities Master Plans, as a guide for decision-making. Administrative Procedure 7120 indicates the hiring process and roles for regular contract faculty and administrators. (IV.B.1)

The president leverages the participatory governance structure of the College to inform decisions related to planning and resource allocation. All participatory governance committees report to the Crafton Council, which is chaired by the College President. Annually, the Crafton Council evaluates all of its participatory governance committees through a committee evaluation process. (IV.B.1)

The administrative structure is appropriately staffed and organized relative to the purpose, size and complexity of the institution. The president delegates authority to administrators and others as appropriate to meet the institution and student needs across the service area. Directly reporting to the College President are the vice presidents in each of three areas: administrative services, instruction, and student services. The Dean of Institutional Effectiveness, Research, and Planning and the Director of Institutional Advancement also report directly to the President. (IV.B.2)

The president of Crafton Hills College leads the College in an open and collegial process in establishing values, goals, and priorities. To carry out these responsibilities, the president delegates authority to administrators and others consistent with their contractual responsibilities to meet the needs for an organization of this size, complexity and to fulfill its mission. The College uses the Comprehensive Master Plan and Program Review to benchmark and provide reflection points related to institutional effectiveness and performance indicators. The College has a cadre of standing governance committees to determine College goals and College performance of key performance indicators (IV.B.2)

The president guides institutional improvement of the teaching and learning environment through established Board Policy 3250, Administrative Procedure 3250, Administrative Procedure 2510, and the College's Organizational Handbook. The Organizational Handbook describes the College's governance committees and reporting structure. (IV.B.3)

To ensure that the College can rely on high quality data and analysis, Crafton Hills College has established an Office of Institutional Effectiveness, Research, and Planning (OIERP). The dean of which reports directly to the College president. Research findings and data are shared with the Crafton Council, committees which report to the Council, and other campus groups to assist data-informed decision making and practices. Planning is conducted in accordance with the Comprehensive Master Plan and carried out via the Program Planning and Review (PPR) processes. (IV.B.3)

Accreditation is an openly discussed theme on campus and at committee meetings. Board Policy 3200 identifies those responsible for ensuring the District complies with ACCJC standard and requirements. The College president is identified in Administrative Procedure 3200 as responsible for appointing the College accreditation liaison officer. Though the leadership of the College president and accreditation liaison officer the College has an established participatory governance committee: Institutional Effectiveness, Accreditation, and Outcomes Committee

(IEAOC). This committee documented the College committees with corresponding charges to the different sub-standards, eligibility requirements, and ACCJC policies. College constituents are represented on all accreditation workgroups, including students. In addition to the President's leadership role, it was evident that the appropriate delegation of responsibilities is assigned to the Accreditation Liaison Officer and that participation in the accreditation process is appropriately shared across constituencies. (IV.B.4)

The president assumes primary responsibility for ensuring consistent implementation of board policies, statutes and other regulations, as well as, for budget oversight and management. The president delegates appropriate authority for day to day budget management to the Vice President of Administrative Services. (IV.B.5)

The president serves on committees and groups to communicate statutes and implement institutional practices consistent with the mission, vision, values, policies, and alignment to the College Comprehensive Master Plan. The president represents the College on the District Budget Committee, where he advocates for District funding to fulfill CHC's Mission. (IV.B.5)

The president works and communicates effectively with the communities served by the College and encourages campus-wide dialogue on issues of institutional importance. There is communication between the president and various groups, e.g., College committees, governing bodies, the Board of Trustees, and the public, via oral and written reports, memos, meeting minutes, messages in campus publications, and the College website. The president attends local and regional boards and associations including chambers of commerce, local service organizations, and K-12 school District board meetings. (IV.B.6)

#### Conclusions:

The College meets Standard IVB.

### **IV.C. Governing Board**

#### General Observations:

The San Bernardino Community College District (SBCCD) Board of Trustees is comprised of seven elected members, and two non-voting student members, who are responsible for the oversight of two Colleges including San Bernardino Valley College and Crafton Hills College.

The Board of Trustees acts appropriately and according to its established policies and procedures. The Board holds two strategic retreats each year to provide time to conduct a self-evaluation, set District priorities, evaluate the chancellor, and receive topical presentations and trainings.

The Board establishes policies that are consistent with the College's mission. The Board reviews Crafton Hills College's educational programs as part of its authority given through Board policy. The chancellor of the District executes policies and procedures and provides oversight to the

needs of the operations of Crafton Hills College through the College president who reports directly to the District chancellor.

#### Findings and Evidence:

The District's locally elected Board has the authority over and has adopted the necessary policies to assure the proper operation and the financial stability of the District. Board Policy 2200, 2410 and 2510 delineate the legal authority of the Board for policy development, provide for constituent group participation in development and approval of board policies, and establish a regular review of board policies, respectively. The Board reviews the District mission, vision, values, goals, and key performance indicators indicating their commitment to student learning programs and services. (IV.C.1)

Evidence gathered demonstrated that Board members engage in robust discussion and work to uphold their call to be a collective Board. Board members act in support of final decisions as confirmed from interviews with two Trustees. To strengthen their commitment to BP 2715, the Board has worked closely with the chancellor and a consultant to clarify their roles and responsibilities, which includes working more effectively as a cohesive body. The Board is active in orienting new Board members, adopting an orientation handbook that covers a broad range of areas including the Brown Act, ethics, and the District and College mission, and supporting further professional development for Board members. (IV.C.2)

There are clearly defined policies for selecting and evaluating the chancellor and presidents of the SBCCD. The team found the Board follows its policies to select and evaluate the Chancellor and College Presidents. The Board makes the final selection for the chancellor position. The Chancellor is evaluated at least annually by the Board of Trustees. The Board of Trustees approves the selection of College Presidents as outlined in BP 7250 and AP 7250 "Educational Administrators". College president are evaluated in the first year of their contract and thereafter every three years. Interviews with trustees validated an inclusive approach has been utilized for the recruitment of a new chancellor. Due to the COVID-19 pandemic the search has been extended until August 2021. (IV.C.3)

The SBCCD Board of Trustees is comprised of seven trustees elected by the constituents of seven designated areas. There are two student trustees, who are non-voting members, elected by the student body at each College. The Board upholds there are no conflicts of interest in service to the public interest of the District. A number of board policies and procedures provide the foundation to ensure that Board responsibilities are met. BP 2345, "Public Participation at Board Meetings" demonstrates the Board's commitment to providing the public opportunity for comment and input. (IV.C.4)

The San Bernardino Community College District Board of Trustees (BOT) has adopted policies consistent with the respective missions of the state Community College system, the District, and the District's two Colleges. The Board is responsible for the fiscal health and stability of the District and recognizes the established resource allocation process of the District. Board policies and Board meeting minutes demonstrate the Board exercises ultimate responsibility for resource distribution based on the recommendations of the Chancellor to whom the planning is delegated.

Each year the Board reviews the annual District financial audit. A review of reports from various ad hoc committees, and special programs, such as the high school partnership programs, Board meeting minutes, and interviews confirmed the Board's demonstration of its fiduciary responsibilities. There is a standing budget subcommittee of the Board that meets monthly to review fiscal data and plans. This subcommittee reviews the following on a regular basis: FTES reports, multi-year budget projections, fiscal audits, and District budget documents. (IV.C.5)

Board bylaws and policies regarding the Board's specifications are published on the District website with attention paid to public ease of access. The District has in place board policies specifying the size and structure of the Board and outline the Board's duties and responsibilities. Operating procedures such as the election of Board Officers, the Board's regular meetings, and Board evaluations are also codified via board policies and administrative procedures. (IV.C.6)

The Board acts in a manner consistent with its policies and bylaws which includes setting District policy and exercising oversight over educational programs and quality, budgetary, and legal matters. The Board engages in a process for adopting or revising policies and procedures as defined in AP 2410 "Board Policies and Procedures". The District follows their process of review in accordance with their published ten-year timeline. The team suggests that the District refine its schedule of policy review to include more frequent review of all board policies. (IV.C.7)

Policies and procedures are revised as necessary for currency with regulations, laws, and/or accreditation requirements. Proposed changes to the BPs and APs are sent to the District Assembly (DA) for review and comment. The District Assembly, which includes representation from all District constituencies, provides recommendations to the Chancellor. The Chancellor determines the recommendations which go forward to the Board of Trustees. (IV.C.7)

The Board engages in the review of key indicators for student learning and achievement and institutional plans. On an annual basis the Board receives presentations on the Student Success Scorecard and the California Community College Chancellor's Office Vision for Success indicators. The Board is presented with a review of scorecard data, the Colleges' Student Equity/Integrated Plan, strategic plans, and the Colleges' Comprehensive Master Plans. The District strategic plan defines Key Performance Indicators (KPI), and progress toward those KPIs are presented to the Board for review. Examples of plans the Board reviews include the District Support Services Strategic Plan update, the Colleges' Comprehensive Master Plans, and Student Equity Plans. (IV.C.8)

Board development includes workshops, study sessions, and attendance at conferences related to effective trusteeship and advocacy, as well as a new trustee orientation. There is a standing board subcommittee on legislative advocacy. Trustees have access to several resources on the Board webpage of manuals and handbooks developed by the Community College League of California (CCLC). The Trustees confirmed their participation in CCLC and ACCT, and new Trustees accessed new trustee trainings provided by these organizations. Several trustees are in the current cohort of the Trustee Fellows program. The District provides opportunities for board development and attendance at outside trainings and conferences. (IV.C.9)



Board Policy 2100 “Board Election” structures four-year Trustee terms with staggered elections every two years to allow for continuity of Board membership. The Board has a process for filling off cycle vacancies. (IV.C.9)

The team found evidence that the Board follows its established annual self-evaluation process as outlined in Board Policy 2745. The annual self-evaluation process has been revised to leverage an outside facilitator to assist and guide the process, supporting the required ad hoc committee in determining the method of evaluation, gathering data, and summarizing results. The ad hoc committee submits self-evaluation results annually to the chancellor. The Chancellor synthesizes the information and presents the findings to the full Board. Results are used to measure goal attainment from the prior years and to set goals for the current year. (IV.C.10)

Board Policy 2715 articulates the Board of Trustees’ code of ethics and prohibition on conflicts of interest. There are nine standards of practice in the policy to which board members must adhere. Board members are required to file conflict of interest forms. Board members have no employment, family ownership, or other personal financial interest in the District or in the College. (IV.C.11)

The Board delegates full responsibility and authority to the chancellor to implement and administer board policies. The Board holds the chancellor accountable for District operations through their job description, performance goals, and annual evaluation. The Board works with the chancellor to set annual performance goals guided by his or their job description and progress towards performance goals. The chancellor delegates authority to the College presidents to implement and administer policies and procedures at their respective Colleges. (IV.C.12)

Board Policy 3200 requires that the chancellor ensure Board members are informed about accreditation organizations, relevant reports and accreditation actions by all agencies that accredit District institutions or programs. Board members receive accreditation updates from the Chancellor at Board meetings and participate in District and external workshops on good trusteeship including their roles in accreditation. Furthermore, the Board recently participated in an ACCJC-conducted accreditation workshop specifically for the District. (IV.C.13)

#### Conclusions:

The College meets the Standard.

### **IV.D. Multi-College Districts or Systems**

#### General Observations:

The San Bernardino Community College District (SBCCD) is comprised of two Colleges, San Bernardino Valley College and Crafton Hills College. The District Chief Executive Officer (CEO), identified as the District Chancellor, reports to a seven-member Board of Trustees. The Board of Trustees selects, and the Chancellor supervises, the College CEOs (College Presidents) and a District office in which several vice chancellors and other administrative staff report to the Chancellor. The District office is an administrative operation that does not directly conduct any

educational programs. The two SBCCD Colleges are accredited separately while the District office is only evaluated through the accreditation review of each College where its operations directly impact the College.

There is a structure of District-wide committees whose functions include integrated planning and resource allocation review and recommendations.

#### Findings and Evidence:

The chancellor establishes clearly defined roles, authority and responsibility between the College and the District. The San Bernardino Community College District Function Map distinguishes functions for which the District is primarily responsible, those for which primary responsibility rests with the individual Colleges, and some for which responsibility is shared in fulfilling each accreditation standard subsection. The chancellor, as District CEO, exercises his leadership in guiding the development of the functional map through the Chancellor's Cabinet. (IV.D.1)

The chancellor provides leadership in setting and communicating expectations through various channels including an annual Leadership Academy and via the Chancellor's Chat newsletter. The format of the Chancellor's Chat newsletters was expanded to include information from Chancellor's Cabinet, which includes the College presidents. (IV.D.1)

The District organizational chart identifies functions and personnel who provide District-wide services. Additionally, the District Assembly, with representation from all constituent groups, collaborates with and helps to inform the decision-making process for the Chancellor and the Board. District level functions are accessed through a four-year program review cycle, which includes an annual resource request process. Additionally, data is collected via an annual employee satisfaction survey and a District Climate Survey. (IV.D.2)

A District Resource Allocation Model (RAM) was developed and approved in 2014. The District Budget Committee is currently reviewing the RAM and developing a proposal for revisions to the model. Interviews validate that discussion and dialog concerning the RAM happen at multiple levels of the organization from the District Budget Committee to the College Budget Committee and various other District and College committees. (IV.D.3)

While both Colleges appear to have sufficient resources to support programs and improvement, and while the Colleges' budget allocation processes is widely understood, the College continues to raise the question of revising the RAM, desiring a process which looks at needed resources. Crafton Hills College has grown from a small to medium sized College without updates to the RAM process. There was mention in interviews that the RAM process may disadvantage Crafton Hills College. Crafton Hills is the smaller College in the District and the RAM is based on FTES generation. (IV.D.3)

Board Policy 2430 "Delegation of Authority" delegates to the chancellor the executive responsibility for administering the policies adopted by the Board and executing all decisions of the Board requiring administrative action. The chancellor then delegates authority to the College presidents. The Chancellor's Cabinet meets weekly to ensure that these responsibilities are

carried out efficiently and effectively. The Chancellor's Cabinet includes the College presidents along with selected District administrators. The Chancellor's Cabinet holds quarterly planning retreats. In addition, the Crafton Hills College President meets monthly with the Chancellor to discuss College matters. College presidents are evaluated based on an established schedule and evaluation tool. Interviews with the Chancellor and Presidents validated that evaluations are conducted according to the established schedule. (IV.D.4)

The District's Office of Research, Planning and Institutional Effectiveness (ORPIE) supports planning and action agendas specific to all aspects of operations, providing coordinated efforts across the District for evidence-based integrated planning. ORPIE, along with the Colleges, conducts and coordinates research to provide data for the Chancellor and Board. For example, ORPIE oversees the annual District Climate surveys and District program assessments, as well as posting evidence on the District website to enable analysis and planning District-wide. Furthermore, ORPIE publishes the District Fact Book, which includes key points of information about students, enrollment trends, programs and services, and outcomes. (IV.D.5)

The District and Colleges have an established communication system to ensure effective operations. Several Districtwide committees (i.e., District Assembly, District Strategic Planning Committee, District Budget Committee) address planning, finance, quality of educational programs, professional development, technology, facilities and other areas where efficient District communication and coordination helps ensure timely, accurate, and comprehensive operations. The structured memberships of these committees include representatives from the Colleges and District office and faculty, staff and students from both Colleges. In addition to the District committees the Chancellor's Cabinet meets regularly to exchange information and coordinate efforts between the District and Colleges. The Chancellor's Cabinet includes the two College presidents and senior administrators from the District office. (IV.D.6)

The District and the Colleges have a robust evaluation process in place to delineate the work of reviewing, updating and refining governance and decision-making processes. The District CEO ensures these roles and functions are effective and ensure the integrity in assisting the Colleges to meet their goals. The instrument most widely used is an employee satisfaction survey, which is administered annually by ORPIE. Based on results from the most recent survey, the District recognizes the need for improvement in areas of information sharing, evaluation, and communications and is revisiting discussions on the RAM in their District committees. (IV.D.7)

### Conclusions:

The College meets the Standard.

## Quality Focus Essay

Through the ISER evaluation process, Crafton Hills College identified activities for improvement under specific standards that align with projects outlined in the Quality Focus Essay. The QFE consists of two projects that will positively influence student learning and achievement outcomes through disaggregated assessment, design and data analysis. Both projects are to be implemented in the 2020-2021 academic year improving student learning/area outcome assessment and use of institutional, course and program level data through data coaching.

### **Project #1 – Assessment of Evaluation**

To improve institutional effectiveness and student learning, Crafton Hills identified two key activities to improve assessment, through conversations at in-services with the Institutional Effectiveness, Outcomes, and Assessment Committee; Faculty Department Chairs Council; and the Educational Technology Committee.

Though the College meets all parts of the standard relating to learning outcomes and assessment, the College recognizes that it can strengthen its processes. Through the peer review process, the team has also concluded that the College can be more consistent with standard II.B.3 by improving SAO assessment; an area the College has noted in its ISER and QFE as needing refinement. The College identified that it needs to: 1.) have a more consistent evaluation cycle (GEOs, ILOs and the definition of the four-point rubric) and 2.) disaggregate its outcomes and assessment data. The College has incorporated components of these projects in numerous standard action plans.

The College has delineated a comprehensive action plan that incorporates activities identified under standards needing additional support. In interviews, evidence review, and general observations from the visiting team, some activities noted in the QFE action plan for Project #1 have already been enacted and have shown promise, particularly with student services programs and the development of SAOs. The team applauds the College for being proactive in ensuring institutional success and quality processes.

### **Project #2 – Data Coaching**

The second project identified in the College's QFE, consists of implementing a data coaching program. Through an institutional assessment of staff and faculty (Climate Survey), Crafton Hills College noted that "35 percent of respondents did not agree that planning and decision-making processes at Crafton are evidence-based." This prompted the College to create a data coaching framework that leverages collaborative inquiry and inclusivity by involving faculty and staff, enhancing its existing culture of inquiry by increasing data literacy.

This framework is tied with providing disaggregated data to strengthen equity endeavors as well as clarifying how evidence leads to collaborative decision making. Similar to the College's first identified project in the QFE, the data coaching project is aligned with activities for

improvement under various standards. In addition, some of the activities outlined in the action plan for the Data Coaching project, have been deployed and results are being recorded as of the fall 2020 semester.

The QFE integrates the areas of improvement indicated in standard action plans, through focused approaches that improve assessment and evaluation through a professional development approach that is grounded in collaboration, inquiry and a clarity in understanding institutional decisions through data literacy.